

# Computed tomographic colonography compared with colonoscopy or barium enema for diagnosis of colorectal cancer in older symptomatic patients: two multicentre randomised trials with economic evaluation (the SIGGAR trials)

Steve Halligan,<sup>1\*</sup> Edward Dadswell,<sup>2</sup>  
Kate Wooldrage,<sup>2</sup> Jane Wardle,<sup>3</sup>  
Christian von Wagner,<sup>3</sup> Richard Lilford,<sup>4,5</sup>  
Guiqing L Yao,<sup>4,6</sup> Shihua Zhu<sup>4</sup> and Wendy Atkin<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Centre for Medical Imaging, University College London, London, UK

<sup>2</sup>Cancer Screening and Prevention Research Group, Department of Surgery and Cancer, Imperial College London, London, UK

<sup>3</sup>Health Behaviour Research Centre, Department of Epidemiology and Public Health, University College London, London, UK

<sup>4</sup>School of Health and Population Sciences, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK

<sup>5</sup>Population Evidence and Technologies, University of Warwick, Warwick, UK

<sup>6</sup>Primary Care and Population Sciences, University of Southampton, Southampton, UK

\*Corresponding author

**Declared competing interests of authors:** Steve Halligan reports non-financial research and development evaluation work provided for iCAD Inc., which develops CAD for computed tomographic colonography. This author also provides expert witness testimony on matters relating to radiological diagnosis of colorectal cancer and holds patents/patent applications for computed tomography imaging technology (2010; International PCT no. PCT/GB2011/050448 'Apparatus and Method for Registering Medical Images Containing a Tubular Organ'). Wendy Atkin reports funds to support this work were also obtained from Imperial College London, London, UK.

Published July 2015

DOI: 10.3310/hta19540

## Plain English summary

### **CTC compared with colonoscopy or BE for diagnosis of colorectal cancer**

Health Technology Assessment 2015; Vol. 19: No. 54

DOI: 10.3310/hta19540

NIHR Journals Library [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk)

## Plain English summary

Computed tomographic colonography (CTC) is a relatively new diagnostic test that uses an X-ray scanner to examine the large bowel for cancer and polyps (which can turn into cancer). We did this research to determine if CTC is more accurate than the existing alternatives used in the NHS for patients who have abdominal symptoms: colonoscopy (for which a flexible camera is inserted into the bowel) and barium enema (BE) (where the bowel is filled with barium liquid and radiographs taken). We investigated whether or not patients preferred CTC and whether or not it is cost-effective. CTC also examines the whole abdomen, whereas colonoscopy and BE do not, so we investigated how much disease outside the bowel was found by CTC.

A total of 5384 patients in 21 NHS hospitals participated in two trials: CTC compared with BE (3804 patients) and CTC compared with colonoscopy (1580 patients). We found that CTC detected significantly more cancers and large polyps than BE, but there was no difference between CTC and colonoscopy. However, about one-third of patients having CTC needed a colonoscopy afterwards to check on possible abnormalities. On average, patients preferred CTC to BE or colonoscopy. About two-thirds of patients having CTC had an abnormality outside the bowel, but this was usually unimportant; fewer than 1 in 10 needed further tests to check whether or not the abnormality was important. CTC detected cancers outside the bowel in about 2% of patients. Our analysis of whether or not CTC is better value for money than BE or colonoscopy was very challenging and our results are subject to very considerable uncertainty which suggests further research should be a priority.



ISSN 1366-5278 (Print)

ISSN 2046-4924 (Online)

Impact factor: 5.116

*Health Technology Assessment* is indexed in MEDLINE, CINAHL, EMBASE, The Cochrane Library and the ISI Science Citation Index.

This journal is a member of and subscribes to the principles of the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) ([www.publicationethics.org/](http://www.publicationethics.org/)).

Editorial contact: [nhredit@southampton.ac.uk](mailto:nhredit@southampton.ac.uk)

The full HTA archive is freely available to view online at [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/hta](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/hta). Print-on-demand copies can be purchased from the report pages of the NIHR Journals Library website: [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk)

## Criteria for inclusion in the *Health Technology Assessment* journal

Reports are published in *Health Technology Assessment* (HTA) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HTA programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

Reviews in *Health Technology Assessment* are termed 'systematic' when the account of the search appraisal and synthesis methods (to minimise biases and random errors) would, in theory, permit the replication of the review by others.

## HTA programme

The HTA programme, part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), was set up in 1993. It produces high-quality research information on the effectiveness, costs and broader impact of health technologies for those who use, manage and provide care in the NHS. 'Health technologies' are broadly defined as all interventions used to promote health, prevent and treat disease, and improve rehabilitation and long-term care.

The journal is indexed in NHS Evidence via its abstracts included in MEDLINE and its Technology Assessment Reports inform National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) guidance. HTA research is also an important source of evidence for National Screening Committee (NSC) policy decisions.

For more information about the HTA programme please visit the website: <http://www.nets.nihr.ac.uk/programmes/hta>

## This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by the HTA programme as project number 02/02/01. The contractual start date was in October 2003. The draft report began editorial review in March 2012 and was accepted for publication in May 2014. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HTA editors and publisher have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the draft document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health.

© Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO 2015. This work was produced by Halligan *et al.* under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library ([www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk)), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland ([www.prepress-projects.co.uk](http://www.prepress-projects.co.uk)).

## **Editor-in-Chief of *Health Technology Assessment* and NIHR Journals Library**

**Professor Tom Walley** Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the HTA Programme, UK

### **NIHR Journals Library Editors**

**Professor Ken Stein** Chair of HTA Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

**Professor Andree Le May** Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (EME, HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

**Dr Martin Ashton-Key** Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

**Professor Matthias Beck** Chair in Public Sector Management and Subject Leader (Management Group), Queen's University Management School, Queen's University Belfast, UK

**Professor Aileen Clarke** Professor of Public Health and Health Services Research, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

**Dr Tessa Crilly** Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

**Dr Peter Davidson** Director of NETSCC, HTA, UK

**Ms Tara Lamont** Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

**Professor Elaine McColl** Director, Newcastle Clinical Trials Unit, Institute of Health and Society, Newcastle University, UK

**Professor William McGuire** Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

**Professor Geoffrey Meads** Professor of Health Sciences Research, Faculty of Education, University of Winchester, UK

**Professor John Powell** Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

**Professor James Raftery** Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

**Dr Rob Riemsma** Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

**Professor Helen Roberts** Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

**Professor Helen Snooks** Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board:  
[www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors)

**Editorial contact:** [nihredit@southampton.ac.uk](mailto:nihredit@southampton.ac.uk)