Immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents: systematic review and economic evaluation

Marcela Haasova,¹* Tristan Snowsill,¹ Tracey Jones-Hughes,¹ Louise Crathorne,¹ Chris Cooper,¹ Jo Varley-Campbell,¹ Ruben Mujica-Mota,¹ Helen Coelho,¹ Nicola Huxley,¹ Jenny Lowe,¹ Jan Dudley,² Stephen Marks,³ Chris Hyde,¹ Mary Bond¹ and Rob Anderson¹

 ¹Peninsula Technology Assessment Group (PenTAG), Evidence Synthesis & Modelling for Health Improvement, University of Exeter, Exeter, UK
²Department of Paediatric Nephrology, Bristol Royal Hospital for Children (University Hospitals Bristol NHS Foundation Trust), Bristol, UK
³Department of Paediatric Nephrology, Great Ormond Street Hospital for Children NHS Foundation Trust, London, UK

*Corresponding author

Declared competing interests of authors: We would like to acknowledge that Stephen Marks received grants from Astellas and Novartis for immunosuppressive randomised controlled studies in paediatric renal transplant recipients during the conduct of the study. In addition, Jan Dudley was a member of an expert review panel in January 2008 and developed consensus recommendation on the optimal use of CellCept[®] (Roche Products) in paediatric renal transplantation and received an honorarium for Roche for this work.

Published August 2016 DOI: 10.3310/hta20610

Plain English summary

Immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation Health Technology Assessment 2016; Vol. 20: No. 61

DOI: 10.3310/hta20610

NIHR Journals Library www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

Plain English summary

Kidney transplantation is the preferred treatment for people with end-stage kidney disease. Without immune-suppressing medications, the transplanted kidney would be rejected or lost. To prevent rejection and loss, a combination of medications to dampen the immune system are used. The aim of this assessment was to evaluate the clinical benefits and cost-effectiveness of nine immune-suppressing drugs in children and adolescents. We searched for relevant studies in major databases, trial registries, systematic reviews and references of included studies. All included studies were assessed for their quality.

The review included three randomised trials and four non-randomised studies. The randomised trials evaluated two drugs [basiliximab (BAS) (Simulect,® Novartis Pharmaceuticals) and tacrolimus (TAC)] and their results were used in cost-effectiveness analyses. No child/adolescent randomised trials were found for the other immune-suppressing drugs. We found statistically significant improvements in transplanted kidney function and proven acute rejection for TAC compared with ciclosporin (CSA) in one trial. The cost-effectiveness analyses suggested that TAC is cost-effective when compared with CSA. BAS was found to be cost-effective in one trial-based analysis but not to be cost-effective in another. An economic model, based on evidence from adults, indicated that only one drug combination (BAS followed by immediate-release TAC and azathioprine) would be cost-effective.

In summary, there is very limited evidence for how effective immune-suppressing drugs are in children and adolescents, and cost-effective analyses comparing all immune-suppressing medications may need to rely on results from studies in adults.

Health Technology Assessment

ISSN 1366-5278 (Print)

ISSN 2046-4924 (Online)

Impact factor: 4.058

Health Technology Assessment is indexed in MEDLINE, CINAHL, EMBASE, The Cochrane Library and the ISI Science Citation Index.

This journal is a member of and subscribes to the principles of the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) (www.publicationethics.org/).

Editorial contact: nihredit@southampton.ac.uk

The full HTA archive is freely available to view online at www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/hta. Print-on-demand copies can be purchased from the report pages of the NIHR Journals Library website: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

Criteria for inclusion in the Health Technology Assessment journal

Reports are published in *Health Technology Assessment* (HTA) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HTA programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

Reviews in *Health Technology Assessment* are termed 'systematic' when the account of the search appraisal and synthesis methods (to minimise biases and random errors) would, in theory, permit the replication of the review by others.

HTA programme

The HTA programme, part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), was set up in 1993. It produces high-quality research information on the effectiveness, costs and broader impact of health technologies for those who use, manage and provide care in the NHS. 'Health technologies' are broadly defined as all interventions used to promote health, prevent and treat disease, and improve rehabilitation and long-term care.

The journal is indexed in NHS Evidence via its abstracts included in MEDLINE and its Technology Assessment Reports inform National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) guidance. HTA research is also an important source of evidence for National Screening Committee (NSC) policy decisions.

For more information about the HTA programme please visit the website: http://www.nets.nihr.ac.uk/programmes/hta

This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was commissioned and funded by the HTA programme on behalf of NICE as project number 09/119/01. The protocol was agreed in July 2014. The assessment report began editorial review in May 2015 and was accepted for publication in October 2015. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HTA editors and publisher have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the draft document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health.

© Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO 2016. This work was produced by Haasova *et al.* under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).

Health Technology Assessment Editor-in-Chief

Professor Hywel Williams Director, HTA Programme, UK and Foundation Professor and Co-Director of the Centre of Evidence-Based Dermatology, University of Nottingham, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

Professor Tom Walley Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the EME Programme, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editors

Professor Ken Stein Chair of HTA Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

Professor Andree Le May Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (EME, HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

Dr Martin Ashton-Key Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Matthias Beck Chair in Public Sector Management and Subject Leader (Management Group), Queen's University Management School, Queen's University Belfast, UK

Professor Aileen Clarke Professor of Public Health and Health Services Research, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Dr Tessa Crilly Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Eugenia Cronin Senior Scientific Advisor, Wessex Institute, UK

Ms Tara Lamont Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Elaine McColl Director, Newcastle Clinical Trials Unit, Institute of Health and Society, Newcastle University, UK

Professor William McGuire Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

Professor Geoffrey Meads Professor of Health Sciences Research, Health and Wellbeing Research and Development Group, University of Winchester, UK

Professor John Norrie Health Services Research Unit, University of Aberdeen, UK

Professor John Powell Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

Professor James Raftery Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Rob Riemsma Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

Professor Helen Roberts Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

Professor Jonathan Ross Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

Professor Helen Snooks Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Professor Jim Thornton Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

Professor Martin Underwood Director, Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

Editorial contact: nihredit@southampton.ac.uk