Using clinical practice variations as a method for commissioners and clinicians to identify and prioritise opportunities for disinvestment in health care: a cross-sectional study, systematic reviews and qualitative study

William Hollingworth,1* Leila Rooshenas,1 John Busby,1 Christine E Hine,2 Padmanabhan Badrinath,3 Penny F Whiting,4 Theresa HM Moore,1 Amanda Owen-Smith,1 Jonathan AC Sterne,1 Hayley E Jones,1 Claire Beynon5 and Jenny L Donovan1

1School of Social and Community Medicine, University of Bristol, Bristol, UK
2Bristol City Council, Public Health, Bristol, UK
3Public Health Suffolk, Suffolk County Council, Ipswich, UK
4Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, Escrick, UK
5South West Commissioning Support, Bristol, UK

*Corresponding author

Declared competing interests of authors: Padmanabhan Badrinath co-ordinates the Clinical Priorities Group in Suffolk. Claire Beynon is a member of South West Commissioning Support. Christine E Hine was a consultant in public health employed by NHS South Gloucestershire and NHS Bristol to provide independent public health advice to health services commissioning during the research period. She was a member of the Bristol, North Somerset and South Gloucestershire Commissioning Advisory Forum. Hayley E Jones reports personal fees from Novartis AG and personal fees from the British Thoracic Society, outside the submitted work. All other authors declare no competing interests.

Published April 2015
DOI: 10.3310/hsdr03130

Plain English summary

Identifying opportunities for disinvestment in health care
Health Services and Delivery Research 2015; Vol. 3: No. 13
DOI: 10.3310/hsdr03130

NIHR Journals Library www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk
Plain English summary

Health-care spending has been restricted since the 2007 economic crisis. We developed tools to help NHS policy-makers identify surgical procedures where there is uncertainty about appropriate use or that might be used too often in some areas of England. We also explored obstacles to reducing spending (disinvesting) on procedures which may be overused.

We used data on NHS surgical procedures (2007 to 2012) to calculate differences in procedure rates among primary care trusts (PCTs) in England after adjusting for need (e.g. population size). In two PCTs we compared local and national procedure rates and reviewed evidence on two procedures [carpal tunnel syndrome (CTS) surgery for hand symptoms and laser capsulotomy for clouded vision] to understand why local rates were high. We observed PCT meetings and interviewed NHS managers, surgeons and patients to better understand the difficulties of regulating surgical procedures rates.

For five procedures the rate of surgery was more than 10 times higher in some PCTs than others. Variation was particularly high where procedure use was rapidly increasing or declining. CTS surgery is cost-effective for many patients but studies provided little evidence on which patients benefit most. There were no high-quality studies of laser capsulotomy. PCT meetings rarely discussed disinvestment. Barriers included lack of collaboration, central support and tools for disinvestment. Clinicians felt some PCT regulation had little impact on practice and most patients were unaware of regulation.

Variation might be used to identify procedures where new studies are most needed to guide policy and identify procedures that might be used too often. Increased NHS support to tackle disinvestment and to provide the relevant tools, data and evidence is needed.
Criteria for inclusion in the Health Services and Delivery Research journal

Reports are published in Health Services and Delivery Research (HS&DR) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HS&DR programme or programmes which preceded the HS&DR programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

HS&DR programme

The Health Services and Delivery Research (HS&DR) programme, part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), was established to fund a broad range of research. It combines the strengths and contributions of two previous NIHR research programmes: the Health Services Research (HSR) programme and the Service Delivery and Organisation (SDO) programme, which were merged in January 2012.

The HS&DR programme aims to produce rigorous and relevant evidence on the quality, access and organisation of health services including costs and outcomes, as well as research on implementation. The programme will enhance the strategic focus on research that matters to the NHS and is keen to support ambitious evaluative research to improve health services.

For more information about the HS&DR programme please visit the website: http://www.nets.nihr.ac.uk/programmes/hsdr

This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by the HS&DR programme or one of its preceding programmes as project number 09/1006/25. The contractual start date was in April 2011. The final report began editorial review in August 2013 and was accepted for publication in March 2014. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HS&DR editors and production house have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors’ report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the final report document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HS&DR programme or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HS&DR programme or the Department of Health.

© Queen’s Printer and Controller of HMSO 2015. This work was produced by Hollingworth et al. under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).
Health Services and Delivery Research Editor-in-Chief

Professor Ray Fitzpatrick  Professor of Public Health and Primary Care, University of Oxford, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

Professor Tom Walley  Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the HTA Programme, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editors

Professor Ken Stein  Chair of HTA Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

Professor Andree Le May  Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (EME, HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

Dr Martin Ashton-Key  Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Matthias Beck  Chair in Public Sector Management and Subject Leader (Management Group), Queen's University Management School, Queen's University Belfast, UK

Professor Aileen Clarke  Professor of Public Health and Health Services Research, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Dr Tessa Crilly  Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Peter Davidson  Director of NETSCC, HTA, UK

Ms Tara Lamont  Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Elaine McColl  Director, Newcastle Clinical Trials Unit, Institute of Health and Society, Newcastle University, UK

Professor William McGuire  Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

Professor Geoffrey Meads  Professor of Health Sciences Research, Faculty of Education, University of Winchester, UK

Professor John Powell  Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

Professor James Raftery  Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Rob Riemsma  Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

Professor Helen Roberts  Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

Professor Helen Snooks  Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

Editorial contact: nihredit@southampton.ac.uk