Health Equity Indicators for the English NHS: a longitudinal whole-population study at the small-area level

Richard Cookson,¹* Miqdad Asaria,¹ Shehzad Ali,¹,² Brian Ferguson,³ Robert Fleetcroft,⁴ Maria Goddard,¹ Peter Goldblatt,⁵ Mauro Laudicella⁶ and Rosalind Raine⁷

¹Centre for Health Economics, University of York, York, UK
²Department of Health Sciences, University of York, York, UK
³Knowledge and Intelligence, Public Health England, York, UK
⁴Norwich Medical School, University of East Anglia, Norwich, UK
⁵Institute of Health Equity, University College London, London, UK
⁶School of Health Sciences, City University, London, UK
⁷Department of Applied Health Research, University College London, London, UK

*Corresponding author

Declared competing interests of authors: Richard Cookson and Peter Goldblatt report grants for related work received during this study and that they are members of the NHS Outcomes Framework Technical Advisory Group, and Brian Ferguson reports that he is Chief Economist, Public Health England.

Published September 2016
DOI: 10.3310/hsdr04260

Plain English summary

Health Equity Indicators for the English NHS
Health Services and Delivery Research 2016; Vol. 4: No. 26
DOI: 10.3310/hsdr04260

NIHR Journals Library www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk
Inequalities of access to health care, and in the outcomes from health care, raise important concerns about both quality of care and justice. People living in more deprived neighbourhoods are diagnosed later, less likely to see a specialist and more likely to die from treatable conditions such as heart disease. The NHS has a legal duty to consider reducing such inequalities. However, reliable information on inequalities is scarce because monitoring currently focuses on the average patient rather than on systematic differences between patients. Local information is especially scarce because it is hard to establish reliable facts about health-care access and outcomes in every single neighbourhood within a local area.

In consultation with members of the public and NHS and public health officials, we developed eight indicators of social inequality in health-care access and health outcomes and a visual way of communicating these indicators on a single page, called ‘equity dashboards’. The public were concerned about inequalities in health-care access, such as the number of patients per general practitioner and hospital waiting times, as well as inequalities in health-care outcomes. The officials told us that equity indicators are more useful if they are presented together on the same page, alongside average performance indicators, and accompanied by graphs showing the underlying inequality patterns. Our indicators look at inequality in health care between more and less deprived neighbourhoods in England of about 1500 people. Five of our indicators are suitable for local monitoring using any administrative geography comprising 100,000 people or more: number of patients per general practitioner, primary care quality, hospital waiting time, preventable emergency hospitalisation and repeat emergency hospitalisation. National equity monitoring can be done using a wider range of indicators, including disease-specific indicators.

We found that NHS health-care inequalities reduced between 2004 and 2011, during a period of substantial investment in primary care services, but that inequality reduction was larger in primary care access and quality than health-care outcomes. NHS actions can therefore have measurable impacts on socioeconomic inequality in both health-care access and health-care outcomes. However, reducing inequality in health-care outcomes is more challenging than reducing inequality in health-care access. Increasing the number of primary care doctors and paying for the quality of care they provide may have small impacts on reducing inequality in health-care outcomes, but further reductions will require new wider approaches to primary care and improved co-ordination between different service providers. Further research is needed to help managers learn quality improvement lessons from areas performing well and badly on health-care equity, to refine the methods, and to monitor other dimensions of equity such as ethnic and regional differences. These indicators can also be used to evaluate the health-care equity impacts of interventions and make international health-care equity comparisons.
Criteria for inclusion in the Health Services and Delivery Research journal

Reports are published in Health Services and Delivery Research (HS&DR) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HS&DR programme or programmes which preceded the HS&DR programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

HS&DR programme

The Health Services and Delivery Research (HS&DR) programme, part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), was established to fund a broad range of research. It combines the strengths and contributions of two previous NIHR research programmes: the Health Services Research (HSR) programme and the Service Delivery and Organisation (SDO) programme, which were merged in January 2012.

The HS&DR programme aims to produce rigorous and relevant evidence on the quality, access and organisation of health services including costs and outcomes, as well as research on implementation. The programme will enhance the strategic focus on research that matters to the NHS and is keen to support ambitious evaluative research to improve health services.

For more information about the HS&DR programme please visit the website: http://www.nets.nihr.ac.uk/programmes/hsdr

This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by the HS&DR programme or one of its preceding programmes as project number 11/2004/39. The contractual start date was in January 2013. The final report began editorial review in December 2015 and was accepted for publication in March 2016. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HS&DR editors and production house have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the final report document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HS&DR programme or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HS&DR programme or the Department of Health.

© Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO 2016. This work was produced by Cookson et al. under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).
Health Services and Delivery Research Editor-in-Chief

Professor Jo Rycroft-Malone  Professor of Health Services and Implementation Research, Bangor University, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

Professor Tom Walley  Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the EME Programme, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editors

Professor Ken Stein  Chair of HTA Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

Professor Andree Le May  Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (EME, HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

Dr Martin Ashton-Key  Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Matthias Beck  Chair in Public Sector Management and Subject Leader (Management Group), Queen's University Management School, Queen's University Belfast, UK

Professor Aileen Clarke  Professor of Public Health and Health Services Research, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Dr Tessa Crilly  Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Eugenia Cronin  Senior Scientific Advisor, Wessex Institute, UK

Ms Tara Lamont  Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Elaine McColl  Director, Newcastle Clinical Trials Unit, Institute of Health and Society, Newcastle University, UK

Professor William McGuire  Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

Professor Geoffrey Meads  Professor of Health Sciences Research, Health and Wellbeing Research and Development Group, University of Winchester, UK

Professor John Norrie  Health Services Research Unit, University of Aberdeen, UK

Professor John Powell  Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

Professor James Raftery  Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Rob Riemsma  Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

Professor Helen Roberts  Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

Professor Jonathan Ross  Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

Professor Helen Snooks  Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Professor Jim Thornton  Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

Professor Martin Underwood  Director, Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

Editorial contact: nihredit@southampton.ac.uk