Identifying back pain subgroups: developing and applying approaches using individual patient data collected within clinical trials

Shilpa Patel,¹* Siew Wan Hee,¹ Dipesh Mistry,¹ Jake Jordan,^{2,3} Sally Brown,⁴ Melina Dritsaki,^{1,5} David R Ellard,¹ Tim Friede,⁶ Sarah E Lamb,^{1,5} Joanne Lord,^{2,7} Jason Madan,¹ Tom Morris,⁸ Nigel Stallard,¹ Colin Tysall,⁴ Adrian Willis,¹ Martin Underwood¹ and the Repository Group[†]

¹Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, Coventry, UK

²Brunel University, Health Economics Research Group, Uxbridge, UK

- ³Surrey Health Economic Centre, School of Economics, University of Surrey, Guildford, UK
- ⁴Universities/User Teaching and Research Action Partnership (UNTRAP), University of Warwick, Coventry, UK
- ⁵Centre for Rehabilitation Research, Nuffield Department of Orthopaedics, Rheumatology and Musculoskeletal Sciences, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK ⁶Department of Medical Statistics, University Medical Centre Göttingen,
- Göttingen, Germany
- ⁷Southampton Health Technology Assessments Centre (SHTAC), University of Southampton, Southampton, UK
- ⁸Leicester Clinical Trials Unit, Diabetes Research Centre, University of Leicester, Leicester, UK

*Corresponding author

†Repository Group collaborators are listed in Acknowledgements

Declared competing interests of authors: Sarah E Lamb is chairperson of the Health Technology Assessment Clinical Evaluation and Trials (HTA CET) Board. Martin Underwood is a member of the National Institute for Health Research Journals Library Editorial Group.

Plain English summary

Identifying back pain subgroups

Programme Grants for Applied Research 2016; Vol. 4: No. 10 DOI: 10.3310/pgfar04100

NIHR Journals Library www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

Plain English summary

Low back pain is a common and costly disorder for both the patient and the health service, which can be managed using different treatment approaches, some of which are delivered in a physiotherapy department. The benefits of treatments delivered by therapists are small, on average, that is, they get small improvements. If we could predict which patients would be most likely to benefit from different treatments it would be possible to improve the overall effectiveness of treatments and potentially make better use of NHS resources. To address this we pooled together data from 19 back pain trials from around the world. This provided us with a data set of 9328 patients. We developed novel statistical methods to identify subpopulations (groups of people with similar characteristics) that would be likely to benefit from certain treatments. Of the three methods developed, two allowed us to identify subpopulations. The additional benefits for individuals in the subpopulations were modest and unlikely to be of clinical importance. Our third method was exploratory and allowed us to identify the chance of a particular treatment choice being effective for a particular patient.

Overall, we did not find any subpopulations that would benefit from treatment. Neither did we find that such an approach to identifying patients would be cost-effective. We have developed new ways of identifying subpopulations and would recommend the application of these methods to other clinical conditions. We have also developed, from prior trials, a data pool that will now become a resource for back pain researchers to help them answer other questions in the field.

© Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO 2016. This work was produced by Patel *et al.* under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Programme Grants for Applied Research

ISSN 2050-4322 (Print)

ISSN 2050-4330 (Online)

This journal is a member of and subscribes to the principles of the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) (www.publicationethics.org/).

Editorial contact: nihredit@southampton.ac.uk

The full PGfAR archive is freely available to view online at www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/pgfar. Print-on-demand copies can be purchased from the report pages of the NIHR Journals Library website: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

Criteria for inclusion in the Programme Grants for Applied Research journal

Reports are published in *Programme Grants for Applied Research* (PGfAR) if (1) they have resulted from work for the PGfAR programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

Programme Grants for Applied Research programme

The Programme Grants for Applied Research (PGfAR) programme, part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), was set up in 2006 to produce independent research findings that will have practical application for the benefit of patients and the NHS in the relatively near future. The Programme is managed by the NIHR Central Commissioning Facility (CCF) with strategic input from the Programme Director.

The programme is a national response mode funding scheme that aims to provide evidence to improve health outcomes in England through promotion of health, prevention of ill health, and optimal disease management (including safety and quality), with particular emphasis on conditions causing significant disease burden.

For more information about the PGfAR programme please visit the website: http://www.nihr.ac.uk/funding/programme-grants-for-applied-research.htm

This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by PGfAR as project number RP-PG-0608-10076. The contractual start date was in October 2010. The final report began editorial review in October 2014 and was accepted for publication in September 2015. As the funder, the PGfAR programme agreed the research questions and study designs in advance with the investigators. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The PGfAR editors and production house have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the final report document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, CCF, NETSCC, PGfAR or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the PGfAR programme or the Department of Health.

© Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO 2016. This work was produced by Patel *et al.* under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).

Programme Grants for Applied Research Editor-in-Chief

Professor Paul Little Professor of Primary Care Research, University of Southampton, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

Professor Tom Walley Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the EME Programme, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editors

Professor Ken Stein Chair of HTA Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

Professor Andree Le May Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (EME, HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

Dr Martin Ashton-Key Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Matthias Beck Chair in Public Sector Management and Subject Leader (Management Group), Queen's University Management School, Queen's University Belfast, UK

Professor Aileen Clarke Professor of Public Health and Health Services Research, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Dr Tessa Crilly Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Eugenia Cronin Senior Scientific Advisor, Wessex Institute, UK

Ms Tara Lamont Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Elaine McColl Director, Newcastle Clinical Trials Unit, Institute of Health and Society, Newcastle University, UK

Professor William McGuire Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

Professor Geoffrey Meads Professor of Health Sciences Research, Health and Wellbeing Research and Development Group, University of Winchester, UK

Professor John Norrie Health Services Research Unit, University of Aberdeen, UK

Professor John Powell Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

Professor James Raftery Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Rob Riemsma Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

Professor Helen Roberts Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

Professor Jonathan Ross Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

Professor Helen Snooks Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Professor Jim Thornton Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

Professor Martin Underwood Director, Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

Editorial contact: nihredit@southampton.ac.uk