The effects of Positive Youth Development interventions on substance use, violence and inequalities: systematic review of theories of change, processes and outcomes

Chris Bonell,¹* Kelly Dickson,² Kate Hinds,² GJ Melendez-Torres,³ Claire Stansfield,² Adam Fletcher,⁴ James Thomas,² Katrina Lester,²† Elizabeth Oliver,² Simon Murphy⁴ and Rona Campbell⁵

¹Department of Social and Environmental Health Research, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, London, UK
²Evidence for Policy and Practice Information and Co-ordinating Centre (EPPI-Centre), Social Science Research Unit, University College London Institute of Education, London, UK
³Division of Health Sciences, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, Coventry, UK
⁴Development and Evaluation of Complex Interventions for Public Health Improvement (DECIPHer), School of Social Sciences, Cardiff University, Cardiff, UK
⁵Development and Evaluation of Complex Interventions for Public Health Improvement (DECIPHer), School of Social and Community Medicine, University of Bristol, Bristol, UK

*Corresponding author
†In memoriam. The report is dedicated to the memory of Katrina Lester, a very fine researcher and a kind and generous woman.

Declared competing interests of authors: Rona Campbell reports grants from University of Bristol during the conduct of the study and is a Director of DECIPHer Impact Limited, a not-for-profit company wholly owned by the Universities of Bristol and Cardiff whose purpose is to maximise the translation and impact of evidence-based public health improvement research and expertise. It does this by selling goods and services starting with the DECIPHer-ASSIST (A Stop Smoking in Schools Trial) smoking prevention programme. Rona Campbell received modest fees in payment for her work as Director which are paid into an account held at the University of Bristol and used to fund research-related activity. Elizabeth Oliver reports grants from the University College London Institute of Education during the conduct of the study.

Published May 2016
DOI: 10.3310/phr04050
Plain English summary

PYD interventions on substance use, violence and inequalities
Public Health Research 2016; Vol. 4: No. 5
DOI: 10.3310/phr04050

NIHR Journals Library www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk
Plain English summary

Positive Youth Development (PYD) delivered outside school provides young people with additional education and leisure opportunities to promote overall personal development, for example in terms of self-esteem, confidence, skills and aspirations. PYD is presented as a way in which to reduce substance use (smoking, drinking alcohol and drug use) and violence. We reviewed existing research on this by examining how PYD is intended to reduce substance use and violence; how delivery is affected by context; and the impacts of PYD on substance use and violence. We explicitly defined what evidence we would include and how we would integrate it. We searched thoroughly for relevant research, finding 48 reports, of which 25 examined impacts, mostly in the USA.

Our review of PYD theory suggested that PYD aims to help young people identify their goals and how to achieve these. This should make them less likely to become involved in or harmed by violence and drug use in their neighbourhoods. Existing theories are not clear about exactly how this protection occurs.

Our review of evaluations of PYD delivery suggest that it is most successful when programmes engage with young people’s families and communities to gain their trust and support. Providers of PYD need to be skilful, but recruiting and retaining such people can be hard when funding is short term. There are sometimes tensions in PYD programmes between letting young people choose what activities to pursue and ensuring that they participate in diverse activities, including education.

Our pooling of the results of evaluations of PYD impacts on young people found very small reductions in substance use and violence, most of which probably occurred by chance.

Currently, there is no good evidence to support investments in PYD delivered outside school to prevent substance use and violence. However, before any new evaluations are undertaken, PYD providers need to be clearer about how interventions are meant to work.
Criteria for inclusion in the Public Health Research journal
Reports are published in Public Health Research (PHR) if (1) they have resulted from work for the PHR programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

Reviews in Public Health Research are termed ‘systematic’ when the account of the search appraisal and synthesis methods (to minimise biases and random errors) would, in theory, permit the replication of the review by others.

PHR programme
The Public Health Research (PHR) programme, part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), evaluates public health interventions, providing new knowledge on the benefits, costs, acceptability and wider impacts of non-NHS interventions intended to improve the health of the public and reduce inequalities in health. The scope of the programme is multi-disciplinary and broad, covering a range of interventions that improve public health. The Public Health Research programme also complements the NIHR Health Technology Assessment programme which has a growing portfolio evaluating NHS public health interventions.

For more information about the PHR programme please visit the website: http://www.nets.nihr.ac.uk/programmes/phr

This report
The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by the PHR programme as project number 12/153/19. The contractual start date was in October 2013. The final report began editorial review in June 2015 and was accepted for publication in November 2015. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The PHR editors and production house have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors’ report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the final report document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the PHR programme or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the PHR programme or the Department of Health.

© Queen’s Printer and Controller of HMSO 2016. This work was produced by Bonell et al. under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).
Public Health Research Editor-in-Chief

Professor Martin White  Director of Research and Programme Leader, UKCRC Centre for Diet and Activity Research (CEDAR), MRC Epidemiology Unit, Institute of Metabolic Science, School of Clinical Medicine, University of Cambridge; Visiting Professor, Newcastle University, and Director, NIHR Public Health Research Programme

NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

Professor Tom Walley  Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the HTA Programme, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editors

Professor Ken Stein  Chair of HTA Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

Professor Andree Le May  Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (EME, HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

Dr Martin Ashton-Key  Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Matthias Beck  Chair in Public Sector Management and Subject Leader (Management Group), Queen’s University Management School, Queen’s University Belfast, UK

Professor Aileen Clarke  Professor of Public Health and Health Services Research, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Dr Tessa Crilly  Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Peter Davidson  Director of NETSCC, HTA, UK

Ms Tara Lamont  Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Elaine McColl  Director, Newcastle Clinical Trials Unit, Institute of Health and Society, Newcastle University, UK

Professor William McGuire  Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

Professor Geoffrey Meads  Professor of Health Sciences Research, Health and Wellbeing Research and Development Group, University of Winchester, UK

Professor John Norrie  Health Services Research Unit, University of Aberdeen, UK

Professor John Powell  Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

Professor James Raftery  Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Rob Riemsma  Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

Professor Helen Roberts  Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

Professor Jonathan Ross  Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

Professor Helen Snooks  Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Professor Jim Thornton  Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

Editorial contact: nihredit@southampton.ac.uk