CHANGE MANAGEMENT RESEARCH PROGRAMME

A SYNTHESIS OF REVIEWS ON LEADERSHIP IN HEALTH CARE

Introduction

The SDO Programme, in association with the NHS Institute for Innovation and Improvement, wishes to commission a synthesis of recent reviews of the literature on leadership in healthcare. It is expected that this will result in a new SDO publication, provisionally called *Leadership in Health care.* This will be on similar lines to the *Organisational Change* book (Iles and Sutherland, 2001), and will also appear under the *Managing Change in the NHS* banner. As before, the book will be 'a review for health care managers, professionals and researchers.'

Background

Leadership in health care is an important topic area within the SDO Programme's Change Management theme. The SDO currently has a number of empirical studies under way in this area. The literature on leadership in health care is now vast, and a number of reviews of it have now been completed. These include a review of the leadership in public services literature published by the Cabinet Office (Strengthening Leadership, 2001).

In parallel with the SDO's research, the NHS Leadership Centre established its own Research into Leadership Programme. The NHS Leadership Centre was originally established in April 2001 to promote leadership development, closely tied to the Modernisation Agency's work to deliver improved services for patients. It was disbanded with effect from 1 July 2005, with responsibility for leadership development being taken on by the NHS Institute for Innovation and Improvement.

The Research into Leadership Programme commissioned reports of literature reviews and evaluations relating to some thirty six aspects of research on leadership and leadership development in health care. The various project reports from this programme are now available on its website, at http://www.leadership.modern.nhs.uk/researchandevaluation/default.aspx.   The Programme ended in July 2005, after which the NHS Institute for Innovation and Improvement became responsible for its outputs.

The research evidence obtained by this programme now needs to be consolidated, synthesised and integrated into the wider literature on leadership research. It also needs to be made available to a wide health service and related audience in an accessible and usable format.

The first step is to bring this evidence together into a single document, and to draw out lessons for both policy and future research in this area. The SDO Programme has agreed to commission this work, and the result will be a joint publication between the SDO Programme and the NHS Institute for Innovation and Improvement.

Current call for proposals

The SDO Programme, in association with the NHS Institute for Innovation and Improvement, now wishes to commission a synthesis of reviews of the literature on leadership in health care, leading to a single publication. This will contain:

- An overview of research in this area;
- A synthesis of the current state of the evidence for specific aspects of leadership in healthcare, based on the Research into Leadership Programme;
- The synthesis should be supplemented where appropriate with additional material known to the team;
- It should include reference to current and completed SDO research on leadership;
- Messages of relevance to health care managers, professionals and researchers;
- A review of the policy implications of the findings; and
- A review of the options for further research on leadership in health care that are presented in the publications reviewed.

The team

The work required now involves a familiarity with the literature on leadership in health care in general and of the reviews produced under the Research into Leadership Programme in particular. This will require academic input. The final output will be an authored book rather than an edited volume, and intending applicants should clearly indicate the name of their lead author. The final document will need to present its findings with a clear, consistent and coherent voice.

Interested applicants are therefore invited to nominate a team which should as a minimum include individuals who collectively bring to the task:

1. Extensive knowledge of the academic and related literature on leadership and leadership development in healthcare; this person will need to be both clear-thinking and non-dogmatic;
2. A clear understanding of the needs for leadership training and support at all levels in the NHS; this person, probably a senior health service manager, will need to be both well-grounded and well-connected;
3. An ability to write clearly and intelligently for a mainly professional but non-academic audience.

In addition there needs to be a broad and active advisory group, with the task of meeting to discuss and challenge the proposed output. Meetings will probably need to be held at the early, interim and late-on stages of the project, and could take the form of one or more workshops.

Outputs

The output of this work will be a draft publication consisting of the following elements:

- An overview of research in this area;
- An account of the current state of the evidence for specific aspects of leadership in healthcare, based on the Research into Leadership Programme, and supplemented where appropriate with additional material known to the team, with messages for NHS managers;
- A review of the policy implications of the findings; and
- A compilation of the list of recommendations for further research.

An indicative contents list for such a publication appears as an appendix to this briefing note. It follows similar lines to those of the Change Management book. It is not intended to be prescriptive, and is for guidance only. It will need to be revised in the light of the analysis of the reviews.

It is however likely to have a brief introduction followed by a number of parts. Possible parts include a description of the field of research on leadership in health care, including definitions for both leadership and leadership development; a summary of the main reviews by topic; and a review of options for future research, based on the conclusions of the previous reviews.

Responsibility for design, layout, production and distribution, and the related costs, will be assumed by the SDO Programme. It is anticipated that the overall length of the book will be similar to that of *Organisational Change: A Review for Health Care Managers, Professionals and Researchers*.

All Intellectual Property Rights will governed as standard Department of Health contract, namely:

Intellectual Property Rights other than Background Intellectual Property Rights to all Results of the Project in which rights may arise as part of, incidental to or resulting from the Project shall vest in the Contractor.

- Without prejudice to the provisions of Chapter III of the Copyright Designs and Patents Act 1988, the Contractor hereby grants to the Authority:

- a perpetual worldwide, royalty free, non-exclusive and irrevocable licence to use or publish information, Data, Results or conclusions arising from the Project in respect of which the Intellectual Property rights have not been assigned to the Authority pursuant to Condition 16 in any form whether amended or edited for any non-commercial purpose; and

- a licence to grant sub-licences of its rights under that licence to any person.

Dissemination

The findings will need to be presented in a format that will be helpful to a range of end-users. These include health care managers, professionals and researchers. The book should be of value to all those with a leadership role in health care, as well as those with responsibility for leadership development in the NHS.

The report should include an account of current SDO research on leadership, and also outline possible further research in this area. It should therefore also be of value to a wide range of NHS and other bodies concerned with commissioning research on leadership. It will also be used to inform the SDO Programme Board on the approaches to take when commissioning substantive research. It is anticipated that further research will be commissioned on this topic in due course.

Application process

The process of commissioning this work will be in **one stage via rapid response mode** and applicants should submit **full proposals**. The work should take no longer than **five months** to complete.

Applicants must submit proposals using the **Rapid Response application form,** which is available as a Word 97 file or Rich text format from Barbara.Langridge@LSHTM.ac.uk.

The application process for this call is via rapid response. Therefore, applicants are asked to submit proposals **via email and post** by **Wednesday, 26 July 2006 at 1.00 p.m.** to:

- **By Email to**: Barbara.Langridge@LSHTM.ac.uk. Please use ref: 'Tender Documents – LS85' as the subject header.

- **By post to**: Barbara Langridge
  Commissioning Manager
  NCCSDO
  London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine
  99 Gower Street
  London
  WC1E 6AZ

Please do not use any previously obtained version of an SDO Programme application form.

FIFTEEN HARD COPIES (one of which should be a signed original) of the completed **Rapid Response application form** should be submitted together with a copy on CD. Please note we will not accept electronic, faxed or hand written proposals. **No late applications will be considered.**

Guidance notes for the completion of the **Rapid Response application form** can be found at the front of the application form.

Funding not exceeding **£50,000** is available for this work, exclusive of printing and distribution costs. **Applicants should note that value for money is an important consideration in respect of this research.** Proposed costs should not exceed these limits.

Following submission of **full** proposals successful applicants will be notified no later than **September 2006.** The project should take no longer than **5 months** to complete and start no later than **1 November 2006.** Please note that these dates are approximate and may be subject to change.

Please clearly label the outside of the envelope in which you submit your proposal with the following: **'Tender Documents – LS85'**. This will enable us to identify proposals and keep them aside so that they may all be opened together after the closing date and time.

Teams should ensure that their proposal complies with the Research Governance Framework, which can be found on the Department of Health website, or via a link on the SDO website under the 'Call for Proposals' page.

We anticipate that there will be informal discussions with NCCSDO throughout the duration of the project regarding the final report. In addition, applicants should indicate how they will work with relevant stakeholders to ensure that their proposed output will meet its objectives.

Applicants should visit the SDO website: http://www.sdo.lshtm.ac.uk to familiarise themselves with the work of the SDO Programme in general and with existing studies on leadership.

Leadership in Health care:

A review for health care managers, professionals and researchers

Contents

Purpose and acknowledgements

Foreword

Introduction

PART 1 : THE LITERATURE ON LEADERSHIP IN HEALTH CARE

1.1: Where does the literature come from?

1.2: What kind of evidence does it provide?

1.3: What is meant by 'leadership'?

1.4: What is meant by 'leadership development?'

1.5: Leadership in the NHS

PART 2: LEADERSHIP IN HEALTH CARE-A SELECTIVE REVIEW

2.1: The nature of leadership

Principal source: Hartley, Jean and Hinksman, Barrie (2003) *'Leadership Development: A systematic review of the literature',* Warwick Institute of Governance and Public Management, Warwick Business School, University of Warwick.

2.2: Leadership in healthcare: the evidence
(what do we know about leadership in the healthcare context?)

2.2.1: Leadership and Teams
Principal source: West, Michael A, Borrill, Carol S, Dawson, Jeremy F, Brodbeck, Felix and Shapiro, David A (2003) *'Leadership Clarity and Team Innovation in Health Care',* Aston Business School, Aston University, Birmingham B4 7ET, and University of Leeds & University of Sheffield and Bob Haward, University of Leeds.

2.2.3: Leadership and Human Resources Management
Principal source: Harris, Claire, Shephard, Amanda and Boaden, Ruth (2003) *'Leadership Through Effective Human Resource Management: Tracking the careers of the first cohort of participants',* Health Organisations Research Centre, UMIST.

2.2.4: Managers and Doctors as Leaders
Principal source: Parkes, Carol (2005) *'The Impact of Differing Personality Types Between Doctors in Leadership Roles and a Comparison Looking at Differing Personality Types*

Between Doctors and Managers in Leadership Positions', Surrey and Sussex SHA, York House, 18-20 Massetts Road, Horley, Surrey RH6 7DE.

2.3: Leadership development in healthcare: the evidence
(what do we know about leadership development in the healthcare context?)

Principal sources: Hartley, Jean and Hinksman, Barrie (2003) *'Leadership Development: A systematic review of the literature',* Warwick Institute of Governance and Public Management, Warwick Business School, University of Warwick.

(2003) *'Innovations in NHS Senior Leader Development',* General Management Development Programmes Group, Cranfield University School of Management.

Other sources: Authors (2003) *'Quick Information Searches: Leadership Development',* Office for Public Management, Grays Inn Road, London.

Burgoyne, John and Williams, Sadie (2005) *'Report on Leadership and Leadership Development Databases'*, Henley Management College, Henley-on-Thames, Oxfordshire.

2.4: Evaluating leadership development in healthcare: the evidence
(To what extent has leadership development been evaluated?)

Principal source: Burgoyne, John and Williams, Sadie (2004) *'Systematic Review: 'Evaluation and leadership development',* Henley Management College, Greenlands, Henley-on-Thames, Oxfordshire.

2.5: Leadership and organisational performance: the evidence
(Does leadership make a difference?)

2.5.1: The Relationship between Leadership and Organisational Performance
Principal source: Bailey, Catherine and Bristow, Michael (2005) *'Luck, Legacy or Leadership',* Cranfield School of Management.

2.5.2: The Relationship between Leadership and Trust Performance
Principal source: Borrill, Carol S, West, Michael A and Dawson, Jeremy F (2003) *'The Relationship between Leadership and Trust Performance'* Aston Business School, Aston University, Birmingham B4 7ET.

2.5.3: The Relationship between Leadership and Staff Satisfaction
Principal source: Borrill, Carol S, West, Michael A and Dawson, Jeremy F (2003) *'The Relationship between Leadership, People Management, Staff Satisfaction and Intentions to Leave',* Aston Business School, Aston University, Birmingham B4 7ET.

2.6: Leadership development and organisational performance: the evidence
(Does leadership development make a difference?)

2.6.1: Relationship between leadership development and organisational effectiveness
Principal source: Buchanan, David A (2003) *'Effective Organisations and Leadership Development: Trends and Issues',* Leicester Business School, Department of Human Resource Management, De Montfort University, The Gateway, Leicester, LE1 9BH.

2.6.2: Impact of health professional leadership development on organisational transformation

Principal source: Williams, S (2004) '*Evidence of the contribution leadership development for professional groups makes in driving their organisations forward',* Henley Management College, Greenlands, Henley-on-Thames, Oxfordshire.

2.6.3: Impact of leadership and leadership development on IT-led transformation
Principal source: Williams, S (2004) *'Evidence of the role of Leadership and Leadership Development in Contributing to the Effectiveness of Major IT-led Transformation',* Henley Management College, Greenlands, Henley-on-Thames, Oxfordshire.

2.6.4: Impact of leadership and leadership development on delivering and developing health services
Principal source: *'How is Leadership transmitted through health service organisations to effect service delivery?* [SDO Programme study, currently in progress].

2.7: Leadership in healthcare: stakeholder perspectives

Principal source: Cummins, Jude, Rudat, Kai and Harvey, Sarah (2005) *'Leading for Improvement through Partnership and Choice: Summary of Consultation with NHS Leaders, Patient Forum Members and the General Public',* Office of Public Management, 252b Grays Inn Road, London, WC1X 8XG.

2.8: Workforce development research relevant to leadership: the evidence
(What is the evidence on the effectiveness of the forms of learning commonly used for leadership development?)

Principal sources: Borrill, Carol and West, Michael (2003), 'Effective human resource management and patient mortality: A toolkit for use by HR professionals in the NHS', Aston University. Caley, Lynne and Reid, Stuart (2003), 'Key influencing factors of work-related learning', University of Cambridge Programme for Industry. Davidson, Lynn and Fielden, Sandra (2005) 'Coaching Effectiveness', UMIST, Manchester.

Summary reports and the full research reports are now available on the web-site, at:
http://www.leadership.modern.nhs.uk/researchandevaluation/default.aspx

PART 3: REFLECTIONS ON EVIDENCE
3.1: Assistance with using available evidence

3.2: Developing an evidence base

3.3: Developing evidence for local action

3.4: Areas for future research

APPENDICES
Appendix 1: Search strategy

Appendix 2: Summary of empirical evidence

Appendix 3: tbc

Appendix 4: Participants at a leadership workshop and seminar?

REFERENCES

Addendum

This document was published by the National Coordinating Centre for the Service Delivery and Organisation (NCCSDO) research programme, managed by the London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine.

The management of the Service Delivery and Organisation (SDO) programme has now transferred to the National Institute for Health Research Evaluations, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre (NETSCC) based at the University of Southampton. Prior to April 2009, NETSCC had no involvement in the commissioning or production of this document and therefore we may not be able to comment on the background or technical detail of this document. Should you have any queries please contact sdo@southampton.ac.uk.