

# Coercion in mental health: a trial of the effectiveness of community treatment orders and an investigation of informal coercion in community mental health care

Tom Burns,<sup>1\*</sup> Jorun Rugkåsa,<sup>1,2</sup> Ksenija Yeeles<sup>1</sup>  
and Jocelyn Catty<sup>1</sup> on behalf of the Oxford Mental  
Health Coercion (OCTET) Programme Group

<sup>1</sup>Department of Psychiatry, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

<sup>2</sup>Health Services Research Unit, Akershus University Hospital, Lørenskog, Norway

\*Corresponding author

**Declared competing interests of authors:** none

Published December 2016

DOI: 10.3310/pgfar04210

## Plain English summary

### Coercion in mental health

Programme Grants for Applied Research 2016; Vol. 4: No. 21

DOI: 10.3310/pgfar04210

NIHR Journals Library [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk)

## Plain English summary

Coercion outside hospital reflects concern over difficulties in helping individuals with severe mental illness to stay well in community care: ensuring that they take their medication and keep in touch with services. In mental health care, *formal coercion (compulsion)* means compulsory treatment. Community treatment orders (CTOs), introduced in 2008, permit mental health teams to treat patients involuntarily at home but recall them if necessary. *Informal coercion* refers to pressures exerted by professionals to induce the patient to stick to treatment. They include *leverage*, where aspects of care (e.g. access to restricted accommodation) are made dependent on patients agreeing to continued treatment.

The Oxford Community Treatment Order Evaluation Trial (OCTET) examined effects of CTOs on 336 patients with psychosis diagnoses discharged from compulsory inpatient care. We conducted a randomised controlled trial (RCT) where half were discharged on a CTO and half to voluntary care. We tested whether or not CTOs reduced the rate of further psychotic episodes (measured by readmission) over 12 months. CTOs neither reduce the number of relapses nor demonstrate improvements in well-being or reductions in costs. Patients, family carers and psychiatrists reported mixed experiences. Our results mirror those in two published RCTs and we concluded that there is no clinical or ethical justification for CTO use.

The OCTET Follow-up Study followed up the same patients for another 24 months. There was still no evidence for CTOs being beneficial. We tested whether or not CTO use leads to improved follow-up or disengagement from mental health services and found no differences.

The Use of Leverage Tools to Improve Adherence in community Mental Health care (ULTIMA) Study investigated lifetime informal coercion, measured primarily by the reported rates of leverage. We asked four distinct clinical groups, totalling 417 people in voluntary community care with mental health and substance misuse services. One-third reported that they had been 'leveraged', with housing support being the most common inducement. This mirrors US patterns but with lower rates. Patients and professionals expressed positive and negative views about leverage, and we also identified a wider range of pressures than those previously described. We produced some ethical guidance for the use of informal coercion.

# Programme Grants for Applied Research

ISSN 2050-4322 (Print)

ISSN 2050-4330 (Online)

This journal is a member of and subscribes to the principles of the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) ([www.publicationethics.org/](http://www.publicationethics.org/)).

Editorial contact: [nihredit@southampton.ac.uk](mailto:nihredit@southampton.ac.uk)

The full PGfAR archive is freely available to view online at [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/pgfar](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/pgfar). Print-on-demand copies can be purchased from the report pages of the NIHR Journals Library website: [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk)

## Criteria for inclusion in the *Programme Grants for Applied Research* journal

Reports are published in *Programme Grants for Applied Research* (PGfAR) if (1) they have resulted from work for the PGfAR programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

## Programme Grants for Applied Research programme

The Programme Grants for Applied Research (PGfAR) programme, part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), was set up in 2006 to produce independent research findings that will have practical application for the benefit of patients and the NHS in the relatively near future. The Programme is managed by the NIHR Central Commissioning Facility (CCF) with strategic input from the Programme Director.

The programme is a national response mode funding scheme that aims to provide evidence to improve health outcomes in England through promotion of health, prevention of ill health, and optimal disease management (including safety and quality), with particular emphasis on conditions causing significant disease burden.

For more information about the PGfAR programme please visit the website: <http://www.nihr.ac.uk/funding/programme-grants-for-applied-research.htm>

## This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by PGfAR as project number RP-PG-0606-1006. The contractual start date was in August 2007. The final report began editorial review in November 2014 and was accepted for publication in March 2016. As the funder, the PGfAR programme agreed the research questions and study designs in advance with the investigators. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The PGfAR editors and production house have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the final report document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, CCF, NETSCC, PGfAR or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the PGfAR programme or the Department of Health.

**© Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO 2016. This work was produced by Burns *et al.* under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.**

Published by the NIHR Journals Library ([www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk)), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland ([www.prepress-projects.co.uk](http://www.prepress-projects.co.uk)).

## **Programme Grants for Applied Research Editor-in-Chief**

**Professor Paul Little** Professor of Primary Care Research, University of Southampton, UK

## **NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief**

**Professor Tom Walley** Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the EME Programme, UK

## **NIHR Journals Library Editors**

**Professor Ken Stein** Chair of HTA Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

**Professor Andree Le May** Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (EME, HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

**Dr Martin Ashton-Key** Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

**Professor Matthias Beck** Chair in Public Sector Management and Subject Leader (Management Group), Queen's University Management School, Queen's University Belfast, UK

**Professor Aileen Clarke** Professor of Public Health and Health Services Research, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

**Dr Tessa Crilly** Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

**Dr Eugenia Cronin** Senior Scientific Advisor, Wessex Institute, UK

**Ms Tara Lamont** Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

**Professor William McGuire** Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

**Professor Geoffrey Meads** Professor of Health Sciences Research, Health and Wellbeing Research Group, University of Winchester, UK

**Professor John Norrie** Chair in Medical Statistics, University of Edinburgh, UK

**Professor John Powell** Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

**Professor James Raftery** Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

**Dr Rob Riemsma** Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

**Professor Helen Roberts** Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

**Professor Jonathan Ross** Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

**Professor Helen Snooks** Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

**Professor Jim Thornton** Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

**Professor Martin Underwood** Director, Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board:  
[www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors)

**Editorial contact:** [nihredit@southampton.ac.uk](mailto:nihredit@southampton.ac.uk)