Cognitive–behavioural therapy and short-term psychoanalytic psychotherapy versus brief psychosocial intervention in adolescents with unipolar major depression (IMPACT): a multicentre, pragmatic, observer-blind, randomised controlled trial

Ian M Goodyer,1* Shirley Reynolds,2 Barbara Barrett,3 Sarah Byford,3 Bernadka Dubicka,4 Jonathan Hill,5,6 Fiona Holland,7 Raphael Kelvin,1,8 Nick Midgley,9,10 Chris Roberts,7 Rob Senior,11 Mary Target,10 Barry Widmer,1 Paul Wilkinson1 and Peter Fonagy10

1Department of Psychiatry, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, UK
2Charlie Waller Institute, University of Reading, Reading, UK
3David Goldberg Centre, King’s College London, London, UK
4Institute of Brain, Behaviour and Mental Health, University of Manchester, Manchester, UK
5Child and Adolescent Psychiatry, University of Manchester, Manchester, UK
6School of Psychology and Clinical Language Sciences, University of Reading, Reading, UK
7Centre for Biostatistics, University of Manchester, Manchester, UK
8Cambridge and Peterborough NHS Foundation Trust, Cambridge, UK
9Anna Freud National Centre for Children and Families, London, UK
10Research Department of Clinical, Educational and Health Psychology, University College London, London, UK
11Tavistock and Portman NHS Foundation Trust, London, UK

*Corresponding author
Declared competing interests of authors: Bernadka Dubicka is a member of the Health Technology Assessment Mental, Psychological and Occupational Health Panel and has received personal fees as a consultant to Lundbeck. She also has a licensed patent: there is a licence to Lundbeck to use brief psychosocial intervention in their current trial (future payment anticipated). Peter Fonagy is in receipt of a National Institute for Heath Research Senior Investigator Fellowship. Paul Wilkinson has received personal fees as a consultant to Lundbeck, a consultant to Takeda and a supervisor in interpersonal psychotherapy. He has also had non-financial support from the interpersonal psychotherapy UK Training Committee. Ian M Goodyer has received personal fees as a consultant to Lundbeck, is supported by a strategic award from the Wellcome Trust, research support from the Friends of Peterhouse and is senior scientific advisor to and chairperson of the Peter Cundill centre for research into mood disorders in young people, University of Toronto, ON, Canada. Raphael Kelvin has received personal fees as a consultant to Lundbeck.

Published March 2017
DOI: 10.3310/hta21120

Plain English summary

CBT and STPP vs. BPI in adolescents with unipolar major depression
Health Technology Assessment 2017; Vol. 21: No. 12
DOI: 10.3310/hta21120

NIHR Journals Library www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk
Plain English summary

Depression affects around 5% of the adolescent population and causes considerable suffering and personal impairment for many, and commonly recurs in adult life. Recurrence is associated with increasing personal difficulties and lower educational and employment prospects. Unlike any previous studies, this study was designed to find out whether or not treatment was still associated with improved outcomes 1 year after therapy was completed. We carried out a randomised controlled trial of 465 adolescents referred to 15 NHS clinics who received a diagnosis of depression. The patients were randomised to cognitive–behavioural therapy, short-term psychoanalytic psychotherapy or brief psychosocial intervention. At the end of study, 70% of adolescents had improved substantially in each of the treatment groups. There were no statistically significant differences in their depression scores, quality of life or treatment costs. There was an approximately 50% reduction in depression symptoms maintained 1 year after end of therapy. The median length of therapy across all three treatments was less than anticipated, ranging from 25 to 28 weeks. The number of therapy visits was also less than anticipated, ranging from 6 to 11 sessions. This study cannot determine the extent to which improvement can be directly attributed to the treatments, but it demonstrates that these three different psychological therapies may be employed in NHS Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services with equal confidence. Further research is needed to find out whether or not these different treatments have advantages for specific types of adolescent depression and whether or not they differ in their long-term effectiveness.
Criteria for inclusion in the Health Technology Assessment journal

Reports are published in Health Technology Assessment (HTA) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HTA programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

Reviews in Health Technology Assessment are termed ‘systematic’ when the account of the search appraisal and synthesis methods (to minimise biases and random errors) would, in theory, permit the replication of the review by others.

HTA programme

The HTA programme, part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), was set up in 1993. It produces high-quality research information on the effectiveness, costs and broader impact of health technologies for those who use, manage and provide care in the NHS.

‘Health technologies’ are broadly defined as all interventions used to promote health, prevent and treat disease, and improve rehabilitation and long-term care.

The journal is indexed in NHS Evidence via its abstracts included in MEDLINE and its Technology Assessment Reports inform National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) guidance. HTA research is also an important source of evidence for National Screening Committee (NSC) policy decisions.

For more information about the HTA programme please visit the website: http://www.nets.nihr.ac.uk/programmes/hta

This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by the HTA programme as project number 06/05/01. The contractual start date was in December 2009. The draft report began editorial review in December 2015 and was accepted for publication in September 2016. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HTA editors and publisher have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors’ report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the draft document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health.

© Queen’s Printer and Controller of HMSO 2017. This work was produced by Goodyer et al. under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).
Editor-in-Chief

Professor Hywel Williams  Director, HTA Programme, UK and Foundation Professor and Co-Director of the Centre of Evidence-Based Dermatology, University of Nottingham, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

Professor Tom Walley  Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the EME Programme, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editors

Professor Ken Stein  Chair of HTA Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

Professor Andree Le May  Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (EME, HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

Dr Martin Ashton-Key  Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Matthias Beck  Chair in Public Sector Management and Subject Leader (Management Group), Queen's University Management School, Queen's University Belfast, UK

Dr Tessa Crilly  Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Eugenia Cronin  Senior Scientific Advisor, Wessex Institute, UK

Ms Tara Lamont  Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Dr Catriona McDaid  Senior Research Fellow, York Trials Unit, Department of Health Sciences, University of York, UK

Professor William McGuire  Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

Professor Geoffrey Meads  Professor of Health Sciences Research, Health and Wellbeing Research Group, University of Winchester, UK

Professor John Norrie  Chair in Medical Statistics, University of Edinburgh, UK

Professor John Powell  Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

Professor James Raftery  Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Rob Riemsma  Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

Professor Helen Roberts  Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

Professor Jonathan Ross  Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

Professor Helen Snooks  Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Professor Jim Thornton  Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

Professor Martin Underwood  Director, Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board:
www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

Editorial contact:  journals.library@nihr.ac.uk