The REFER (REFer for EchocaRdiogram) study: a prospective validation and health economic analysis of a clinical decision rule, NT-proBNP or their combination in the diagnosis of heart failure in primary care

Clare J Taylor,1 Mark Monahan,2 Andrea K Roalfe,2 Pelham Barton,2 Rachel Iles2 and FD Richard Hobbs1* on behalf of the other REFER investigators

1Nuffield Department of Primary Care Health Sciences, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK
2Institute of Applied Health Research, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK

*Corresponding author richard.hobbs@phc.ox.ac.uk

Declared competing interests of authors: FD Richard Hobbs has received grants from Roche Diagnostics outside the submitted work. The work was supported by funding from the National Institute for Health Research Efficacy and Mechanism Evaluation programme. Roche Diagnostics provided the N-terminal pro-B-type natriuretic peptide testing equipment but did not have any influence on study design, conduct or reporting.

Published April 2017
DOI: 10.3310/eme04030
Heart failure is a common problem in which the heart muscle functions less well and this results in unpleasant symptoms for patients (e.g. shortness of breath) and can shorten life. Fortunately, there are treatments available that can improve symptoms and delay the condition becoming worse, but symptoms can be vague, making diagnosis difficult. Accurate diagnosis requires referral for further investigation, which usually includes an ultrasound scan of the heart.

The aim of the REFER study was to investigate whether or not a clinical decision aid (called the MICE rule), with or without a simple blood test (called NT-proBNP), could improve the accuracy of general practitioner (GP) diagnosis of heart failure in people over the age of 55 years. The results showed that the MICE rule was not helpful in improving diagnosis but the blood test was helpful (and cost-effective) in deciding which people needed referral for a heart scan. The REFER study also indicated that the cut-off point for this blood test set by the National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) may be too high.

Patients and their carers should be reassured that this study showed that, if they go to see their GP with heart failure symptoms, the best thing for the GP to do is to carry out a blood test for NT-proBNP, which is what currently happens in the NHS. We recommend, however, that NICE considers lowering the blood test threshold level for further testing to ensure that patients with a possible diagnosis of heart failure are not missed.
Criteria for inclusion in the Efficacy and Mechanism Evaluation journal

Reports are published in Efficacy and Mechanism Evaluation (EME) if (1) they have resulted from work for the EME programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

EME programme

The Efficacy and Mechanism Evaluation (EME) programme was set up in 2008 as part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) and the Medical Research Council (MRC) coordinated strategy for clinical trials. The EME programme is broadly aimed at supporting ‘science driven’ studies with an expectation of substantial health gain and aims to support excellent clinical science with an ultimate view to improving health or patient care.

Its remit includes evaluations of new treatments, including therapeutics (small molecule and biologic), psychological interventions, public health, diagnostics and medical devices. Treatments or interventions intended to prevent disease are also included.

The EME programme supports laboratory based or similar studies that are embedded within the main study if relevant to the remit of the EME programme. Studies that use validated surrogate markers as indicators of health outcome are also considered.

For more information about the EME programme please visit the website: http://www.nets.nihr.ac.uk/programmes/eme

This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by the EME programme as project number 09/160/13. The contractual start date was in July 2011. The final report began editorial review in August 2015 and was accepted for publication in July 2016. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The EME editors and production house have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors’ report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the final report document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research. The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, the MRC, NETSCC, the EME programme or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the EME programme or the Department of Health.

© Queen’s Printer and Controller of HMSO 2017. This work was produced by Taylor et al. under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).
**Efficacy and Mechanism Evaluation Editor-in-Chief**

**Professor David Crossman**  Bute Professor of Medicine and Dean and Head of Faculty of Medicine, University of St Andrews, and Honorary Consultant Cardiologist, NHS Fife Health Board, UK

**NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief**

**Professor Tom Walley**  Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the EME Programme, UK

**NIHR Journals Library Editors**

**Professor Ken Stein**  Chair of HTA Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

**Professor Andree Le May**  Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (EME, HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

**Dr Martin Ashton-Key**  Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

**Professor Matthias Beck**  Chair in Public Sector Management and Subject Leader (Management Group), Queen’s University Management School, Queen’s University Belfast, UK

**Dr Tessa Crilly**  Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

**Dr Eugenia Cronin**  Senior Scientific Advisor, Wessex Institute, UK

**Ms Tara Lamont**  Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

**Dr Catriona McDaid**  Senior Research Fellow, York Trials Unit, Department of Health Sciences, University of York, UK

**Professor William McGuire**  Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

**Professor Geoffrey Meads**  Professor of Health Sciences Research, Health and Wellbeing Research Group, University of Winchester, UK

**Professor John Norrie**  Chair in Medical Statistics, University of Edinburgh, UK

**Professor John Powell**  Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

**Professor James Raftery**  Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

**Dr Rob Riemsma**  Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

**Professor Helen Roberts**  Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

**Professor Jonathan Ross**  Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

**Professor Helen Snooks**  Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

**Professor Jim Thornton**  Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

**Professor Martin Underwood**  Director, Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

**Editorial contact:** journals.library@nihr.ac.uk