Seclusion and Psychiatric Intensive Care Evaluation Study (SPICES): combined qualitative and quantitative approaches to the uses and outcomes of coercive practices in mental health services

Len Bowers,¹ Alexis E Cullen,¹ Evanthia Achilla,¹
John Baker,² Mizanur Khondoker,¹ Leonardo Koeser,¹
Lois Moylan,³ Sophie Pettit,¹ Alan Quirk,⁴ Faisil Sethi,⁵
Duncan Stewart,¹ Paul McCrone¹ and Alex D Tulloch^{1,5}*

Declared competing interests of authors: Alex D Tulloch and Faisil Sethi work as consultant psychiatrists for South London and Maudsley NHS Foundation Trust. Faisil Sethi is vice chairperson of the National Association of Psychiatric Intensive Care Units.

Published June 2017 DOI: 10.3310/hsdr05210

Plain English summary

Seclusion and Psychiatric Intensive Care Evaluation Study (SPICES)

Health Services and Delivery Research 2017; Vol. 5: No. 21

DOI: 10.3310/hsdr05210

NIHR Journals Library www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

¹Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology & Neuroscience, King's College London, London, UK

²School of Healthcare, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK

³Department of Nursing, Molloy College, Rockville, NY, USA

⁴Royal College of Psychiatrists, London, UK

⁵South London and Maudsley NHS Foundation Trust, London, UK

^{*}Corresponding author alex.tulloch@kcl.ac.uk

Plain English summary

Patients admitted to acute psychiatric wards can be very disturbed and may behave in ways that severely harm them or people around them. When patients behave in these ways, staff act to prevent that harm and to contain the person safely. Two methods used at some hospitals are either locking the patient by themselves in a robust room (seclusion) or transferring the patient to a specialist robust ward with small numbers of other patients and lots of staff [a psychiatric intensive care unit (PICU)]. We used the patient records in one NHS trust to compare patients who did and did not receive seclusion or PICU care (study 1). We found that those who were subject to these interventions were more likely to be aggressive again afterwards and also that their care tended to be more expensive; however, the way our research was carried out means that this does not necessarily mean that seclusion and PICU increased aggression and costs of care. We also interviewed and tested nurses at a number of hospitals that did and did not have seclusion rooms or on-site PICUs (study 2). Without access to seclusion, nurses were slower to manually restrain patients, but were more likely to calm patients using sedating drugs by injection and to use other potentially risky management methods. Our results were not strong enough to make definitive recommendations, but it was clear that there are no easy courses of action in these difficult circumstances. However, any hospital considering increasing access to seclusion or a PICU should do so with great caution.

Health Services and Delivery Research

ISSN 2050-4349 (Print)

ISSN 2050-4357 (Online)

This journal is a member of and subscribes to the principles of the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) (www.publicationethics.org/).

Editorial contact: journals.library@nihr.ac.uk

The full HS&DR archive is freely available to view online at www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/hsdr. Print-on-demand copies can be purchased from the report pages of the NIHR Journals Library website: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

Criteria for inclusion in the Health Services and Delivery Research journal

Reports are published in *Health Services and Delivery Research* (HS&DR) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HS&DR programme or programmes which preceded the HS&DR programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

HS&DR programme

The Health Services and Delivery Research (HS&DR) programme, part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), was established to fund a broad range of research. It combines the strengths and contributions of two previous NIHR research programmes: the Health Services Research (HSR) programme and the Service Delivery and Organisation (SDO) programme, which were merged in January 2012.

The HS&DR programme aims to produce rigorous and relevant evidence on the quality, access and organisation of health services including costs and outcomes, as well as research on implementation. The programme will enhance the strategic focus on research that matters to the NHS and is keen to support ambitious evaluative research to improve health services.

For more information about the HS&DR programme please visit the website: http://www.nets.nihr.ac.uk/programmes/hsdr

This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by the HS&DR programme or one of its preceding programmes as project number 11/1024/02. The contractual start date was in March 2013. The final report began editorial review in January 2016 and was accepted for publication in December 2016. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HS&DR editors and production house have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the final report document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HS&DR programme or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HS&DR programme or the Department of Health.

© Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO 2017. This work was produced by Bowers et al. under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).

Health Services and Delivery Research Editor-in-Chief

Professor Jo Rycroft-Malone Professor of Health Services and Implementation Research, Bangor University, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

Professor Tom Walley Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the EME Programme, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editors

Professor Ken Stein Chair of HTA and EME Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

Professor Andree Le May Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

Dr Martin Ashton-Key Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Professor Matthias Beck Chair in Public Sector Management and Subject Leader (Management Group), Queen's University Management School, Queen's University Belfast, UK

Dr Tessa Crilly Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Eugenia Cronin Senior Scientific Advisor, Wessex Institute, UK

Ms Tara Lamont Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

Dr Catriona McDaid Senior Research Fellow, York Trials Unit, Department of Health Sciences, University of York, UK

Professor William McGuire Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

Professor Geoffrey Meads Professor of Health Sciences Research, Health and Wellbeing Research Group, University of Winchester, UK

Professor John Norrie Chair in Medical Statistics, University of Edinburgh, UK

Professor John Powell Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

Professor James Raftery Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Rob Riemsma Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

Professor Helen Roberts Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

Professor Jonathan Ross Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

Professor Helen Snooks Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Professor Jim Thornton Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

Professor Martin Underwood Director, Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

Editorial contact: journals.library@nihr.ac.uk