

# Virtual chromoendoscopy for the real-time assessment of colorectal polyps in vivo: a systematic review and economic evaluation

Joanna Picot,<sup>1\*</sup> Micah Rose,<sup>1</sup> Keith Cooper,<sup>1</sup>  
Karen Pickett,<sup>1</sup> Joanne Lord,<sup>1</sup> Petra Harris,<sup>1</sup>  
Sophie Whyte,<sup>2</sup> Dankmar Böhning<sup>3</sup>  
and Jonathan Shepherd<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Southampton Health Technology Assessments Centre (SHTAC), University of Southampton, Southampton, UK

<sup>2</sup>School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR), University of Sheffield, Sheffield, UK

<sup>3</sup>Southampton Statistical Sciences Research Institute (S3RI), Mathematical Sciences, University of Southampton, Southampton, UK

\*Corresponding author [j.picot@soton.ac.uk](mailto:j.picot@soton.ac.uk)

**Declared competing interests of authors:** Joanne Lord reports membership of the National Institute for Health Research Health Technology Assessment Commissioning Board from 2011 to 2016. Sophie Whyte reports personal fees from Southampton Health Technology Assessments Centre during the conduct of the study.

**Note:** The associated economic model in this report is protected by intellectual property rights, which are owned by the University of Southampton. Anyone wishing to modify, adapt, translate, reverse engineer, decompile, dismantle or create derivative work based on the economic model must first seek the agreement of the property owners.

Published December 2017

DOI: 10.3310/hta21790

## Plain English summary

### Virtual chromoendoscopy for assessment of colorectal polyps

Health Technology Assessment 2017; Vol. 21: No. 79

DOI: 10.3310/hta21790

NIHR Journals Library [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk)

## Plain English summary

Colorectal polyps are growths in the large bowel. Some polyp types, called adenomas, can develop into bowel cancer if not diagnosed and removed. Specialised doctors or nurses, called 'endoscopists', can find polyps when they look at the inner lining of the large bowel (colonoscopy). If a polyp is found, it is removed and sent to a laboratory to see if it is an adenoma (this is called 'histopathology'). A new technique, called virtual chromoendoscopy (VCE), allows the endoscopist to view the polyp in a different way, and this can be used during a colonoscopy to help endoscopists decide if a very small polyp (5 mm or smaller) is an adenoma or not, instead of sending the polyp to a laboratory. If the endoscopist is confident that the very small polyp is not an adenoma it could be left in the bowel, rather than removed. We aimed to assess the benefits and harms of three VCE technologies for diagnosing very small polyps compared with histopathology, and whether or not these are an effective use of NHS financial resources. We found and reviewed all the studies that had assessed the three technologies [narrow-band imaging (NBI), i-scan, and flexible spectral imaging colour enhancement (FICE)], using standard methods, and created an economic model. We found that the proportion of adenomas that were correctly identified as adenomas by VCE varied between studies from 55% to 97%. Limiting the analysis to the polyp assessments that endoscopists made with high confidence typically increased the proportion of adenomas that were correctly identified as adenomas by VCE, but results still varied between studies from 59% to 98%. Endoscopists experienced in VCE achieved better results than those without experience. VCE techniques were estimated to be cost saving compared with histopathology. The model estimated that NBI and i-scan had slightly better long-term outcomes than histopathology, whereas FICE had slightly worse outcomes.

ISSN 1366-5278 (Print)

ISSN 2046-4924 (Online)

Impact factor: 4.236

*Health Technology Assessment* is indexed in MEDLINE, CINAHL, EMBASE, The Cochrane Library and the Clarivate Analytics Science Citation Index.

This journal is a member of and subscribes to the principles of the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) ([www.publicationethics.org/](http://www.publicationethics.org/)).

Editorial contact: [journals.library@nhr.ac.uk](mailto:journals.library@nhr.ac.uk)

The full HTA archive is freely available to view online at [www.journalslibrary.nhr.ac.uk/hta](http://www.journalslibrary.nhr.ac.uk/hta). Print-on-demand copies can be purchased from the report pages of the NIHR Journals Library website: [www.journalslibrary.nhr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nhr.ac.uk)

## Criteria for inclusion in the *Health Technology Assessment* journal

Reports are published in *Health Technology Assessment* (HTA) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HTA programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

Reviews in *Health Technology Assessment* are termed 'systematic' when the account of the search appraisal and synthesis methods (to minimise biases and random errors) would, in theory, permit the replication of the review by others.

## HTA programme

The HTA programme, part of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR), was set up in 1993. It produces high-quality research information on the effectiveness, costs and broader impact of health technologies for those who use, manage and provide care in the NHS. 'Health technologies' are broadly defined as all interventions used to promote health, prevent and treat disease, and improve rehabilitation and long-term care.

The journal is indexed in NHS Evidence via its abstracts included in MEDLINE and its Technology Assessment Reports inform National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) guidance. HTA research is also an important source of evidence for National Screening Committee (NSC) policy decisions.

For more information about the HTA programme please visit the website: <http://www.nets.nhr.ac.uk/programmes/hta>

## This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was commissioned and funded by the HTA programme on behalf of NICE as project number 15/17/05. The protocol was agreed in February 2016. The assessment report began editorial review in September 2016 and was accepted for publication in March 2017. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HTA editors and publisher have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the draft document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health.

**© Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO 2017. This work was produced by Picot *et al.* under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.**

Published by the NIHR Journals Library ([www.journalslibrary.nhr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nhr.ac.uk)), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland ([www.prepress-projects.co.uk](http://www.prepress-projects.co.uk)).

## Health Technology Assessment Editor-in-Chief

**Professor Hywel Williams** Director, HTA Programme, UK and Foundation Professor and Co-Director of the Centre of Evidence-Based Dermatology, University of Nottingham, UK

## NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

**Professor Tom Walley** Director, NIHR Evaluation, Trials and Studies and Director of the EME Programme, UK

## NIHR Journals Library Editors

**Professor Ken Stein** Chair of HTA and EME Editorial Board and Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

**Professor Andrée Le May** Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals)

**Dr Martin Ashton-Key** Consultant in Public Health Medicine/Consultant Advisor, NETSCC, UK

**Professor Matthias Beck** Professor of Management, Cork University Business School, Department of Management and Marketing, University College Cork, Ireland

**Dr Tessa Crilly** Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

**Dr Eugenia Cronin** Senior Scientific Advisor, Wessex Institute, UK

**Dr Peter Davidson** Director of the NIHR Dissemination Centre, University of Southampton, UK

**Ms Tara Lamont** Scientific Advisor, NETSCC, UK

**Dr Catriona McDaid** Senior Research Fellow, York Trials Unit, Department of Health Sciences, University of York, UK

**Professor William McGuire** Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

**Professor Geoffrey Meads** Professor of Wellbeing Research, University of Winchester, UK

**Professor John Norrie** Chair in Medical Statistics, University of Edinburgh, UK

**Professor John Powell** Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK

**Professor James Raftery** Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

**Dr Rob Riemsma** Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

**Professor Helen Roberts** Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Institute of Child Health, UK

**Professor Jonathan Ross** Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

**Professor Helen Snooks** Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

**Professor Jim Thornton** Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

**Professor Martin Underwood** Director, Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Please visit the website for a list of members of the NIHR Journals Library Board:  
[www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors)

**Editorial contact:** [journals.library@nihr.ac.uk](mailto:journals.library@nihr.ac.uk)