

Lead-I ECG for detecting atrial fibrillation in patients with an irregular pulse using single time point testing: a systematic review and economic evaluation

Rui Duarte,^{1*} Angela Stainthorpe,¹
Janette Greenhalgh,¹ Marty Richardson,¹
Sarah Nevitt,^{1,2} James Mahon,³ Eleanor Kotas,¹
Angela Boland,¹ Howard Thom,⁴ Tom Marshall,⁵
Mark Hall⁶ and Yemisi Takwoingi^{5,7}

¹Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group (LRiG), Institute of Population Health Sciences, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, UK

²Department of Biostatistics, Institute of Translational Medicine, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, UK

³Coldingham Analytical Services, Berwickshire, UK

⁴Bristol Medical School, Population Health Sciences, University of Bristol, Bristol, UK

⁵Institute of Applied Health Research, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK

⁶Liverpool Heart and Chest Hospital NHS Foundation Trust, Liverpool, UK

⁷NIHR Birmingham Biomedical Research Centre, University Hospitals Birmingham NHS Foundation Trust and University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK

*Corresponding author rui.duarte@liverpool.ac.uk

Declared competing interests of authors: Howard Thom reports personal fees from Novartis Pharmaceuticals UK Ltd (Camberley, UK), Pfizer Inc. (New York, NY, USA), F. Hoffman-La Roche AG (Basel, Switzerland), Bayer AG (Leverkusen, Germany) and Janssen (Beerse, Belgium), all unrelated to the submitted work. Tom Marshall was a member of the National Institute for Health Research Health Technology Assessment and Efficacy and Mechanism Evaluation Editorial Board (2009–11).

Published January 2020

DOI: 10.3310/hta24030

Plain English summary

Lead-I ECG for detecting atrial fibrillation

Health Technology Assessment 2020; Vol. 24: No. 3

DOI: 10.3310/hta24030

NIHR Journals Library www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

Plain English summary

Atrial fibrillation (AF) is the most common type of abnormal heart rhythm. People with AF are more likely to have a serious stroke or die than people without the condition. Many people go to their general practitioner (GP) with the signs or symptoms commonly linked to AF, such as feeling dizzy, being short of breath, feeling tired and having heart palpitations. GPs check for AF by taking the patient's pulse by hand. If the GP thinks that the patient might have AF, a 12-lead electrocardiogram (ECG) test is arranged. Lead-I (i.e. one lead) ECGs are handheld electronic devices that could detect AF more accurately than a manual pulse check. If GPs were to routinely use lead-I ECG devices, people with suspected AF could receive treatment while waiting for the AF diagnosis to be confirmed by a 12-lead ECG. This study aimed to assess whether or not the use of lead-I ECGs in GP surgeries could benefit these patients and offer good value for money to the NHS. All studies that examined how well lead-I ECGs identified people with AF were reviewed, and the economic value of using these devices was assessed. No evidence was found that examined the use of lead-I ECGs for people with signs or symptoms of AF. As an alternative, evidence for the use of lead-I ECGs for people with no symptoms of AF was searched for and these data were used to assess value for money. The study found that using a manual pulse check followed by a lead-I ECG offers value for money when compared with a manual pulse check followed by a 12-lead ECG. This is mostly because patients with AF can begin treatment earlier when a GP has access to a lead-I ECG device.

ISSN 1366-5278 (Print)

ISSN 2046-4924 (Online)

Impact factor: 3.819

Health Technology Assessment is indexed in MEDLINE, CINAHL, EMBASE, The Cochrane Library and the Clarivate Analytics Science Citation Index.

This journal is a member of and subscribes to the principles of the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) (www.publicationethics.org/).

Editorial contact: journals.library@nhr.ac.uk

The full HTA archive is freely available to view online at www.journalslibrary.nhr.ac.uk/hta. Print-on-demand copies can be purchased from the report pages of the NIHR Journals Library website: www.journalslibrary.nhr.ac.uk

Criteria for inclusion in the *Health Technology Assessment* journal

Reports are published in *Health Technology Assessment* (HTA) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HTA programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

Reviews in *Health Technology Assessment* are termed 'systematic' when the account of the search appraisal and synthesis methods (to minimise biases and random errors) would, in theory, permit the replication of the review by others.

HTA programme

Health Technology Assessment (HTA) research is undertaken where some evidence already exists to show that a technology can be effective and this needs to be compared to the current standard intervention to see which works best. Research can evaluate any intervention used in the treatment, prevention or diagnosis of disease, provided the study outcomes lead to findings that have the potential to be of direct benefit to NHS patients. Technologies in this context mean any method used to promote health; prevent and treat disease; and improve rehabilitation or long-term care. They are not confined to new drugs and include any intervention used in the treatment, prevention or diagnosis of disease.

The journal is indexed in NHS Evidence via its abstracts included in MEDLINE and its Technology Assessment Reports inform National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) guidance. HTA research is also an important source of evidence for National Screening Committee (NSC) policy decisions.

This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was commissioned and funded by the HTA programme on behalf of NICE as project number 16/30/05. The protocol was agreed in March 2018. The assessment report began editorial review in October 2018 and was accepted for publication in January 2019. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HTA editors and publisher have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the draft document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health and Social Care. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health and Social Care.

© Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO 2020. This work was produced by Duarte *et al.* under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health and Social Care. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nhr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).

NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

Professor Ken Stein Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editors

Professor John Powell Chair of HTA and EME Editorial Board and Editor-in-Chief of HTA and EME journals. Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK, and Senior Clinical Researcher, Nuffield Department of Primary Care Health Sciences, University of Oxford, UK

Professor Andrée Le May Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals) and Editor-in-Chief of HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals

Professor Matthias Beck Professor of Management, Cork University Business School, Department of Management and Marketing, University College Cork, Ireland

Dr Tessa Crilly Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Eugenia Cronin Senior Scientific Advisor, Wessex Institute, UK

Dr Peter Davidson Consultant Advisor, Wessex Institute, University of Southampton, UK

Ms Tara Lamont Director, NIHR Dissemination Centre, UK

Dr Catriona McDaid Senior Research Fellow, York Trials Unit, Department of Health Sciences, University of York, UK

Professor William McGuire Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

Professor Geoffrey Meads Professor of Wellbeing Research, University of Winchester, UK

Professor John Norrie Chair in Medical Statistics, University of Edinburgh, UK

Professor James Raftery Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Rob Riemsma Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

Professor Helen Roberts Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Great Ormond Street Institute of Child Health, UK

Professor Jonathan Ross Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

Professor Helen Snooks Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Professor Ken Stein Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

Professor Jim Thornton Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

Professor Martin Underwood Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Please visit the website for a list of editors: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

Editorial contact: journals.library@nihr.ac.uk