

# Evaluating alcohol intoxication management services: the EDARA mixed-methods study

Simon C Moore,<sup>1,2\*</sup> Davina Allen,<sup>3</sup> Yvette Amos,<sup>2</sup>  
Joanne Blake,<sup>3</sup> Alan Brennan,<sup>4</sup> Penny Buykx,<sup>4,5</sup>  
Steve Goodacre,<sup>4</sup> Laura Gray,<sup>4</sup> Andy Irving,<sup>4</sup>  
Alicia O’Cathain,<sup>4</sup> Vaseekaran Sivarajasingam<sup>2</sup>  
and Tracey Young<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Crime and Security Research Institute, Cardiff University, Cardiff, UK

<sup>2</sup>Violence Research Group, School of Dentistry, Cardiff University, Cardiff, UK

<sup>3</sup>School of Healthcare Sciences, Cardiff University, Cardiff, UK

<sup>4</sup>School of Health and Related Research (SchARR), University of Sheffield, Sheffield, UK

<sup>5</sup>School of Humanities and Social Science, University of Newcastle, Newcastle, NSW, Australia

\*Corresponding author [mooresc2@cardiff.ac.uk](mailto:mooresc2@cardiff.ac.uk)

**Declared competing interests of authors:** Steve Goodacre is chairperson of the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Health Technology Assessment (HTA) programme Commissioning Committee (2019 to present), deputy director of the HTA programme (2019–present), a member of the HTA Funding Boards Policy Group (2016 to present) and chairperson of the NIHR Clinical Trials Unit Standing Advisory Committee (2019 to present).

**Disclaimer:** This report contains transcripts of interviews conducted in the course of the research and contains language that may offend some readers.

Published June 2020

DOI: 10.3310/hsdr08240

## Plain English summary

### The EDARA mixed-methods study

Health Services and Delivery Research 2020; Vol. 8: No. 24

DOI: 10.3310/hsdr08240

NIHR Journals Library [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk)

## Plain English summary

Night-time environments are associated with alcohol use and related harms. Alcohol can make people ill and they may need assistance from health-care, ambulance and police services. Space in which these people can recover is lacking and many attend an accident and emergency department, which affects other patients. Some cities have developed alcohol intoxication management services, which provide space into which patients can be referred and which have staff who can look after these patients. It is not known if alcohol intoxication management services are effective, cost-effective, acceptable to people who use them or improve the accident and emergency department environment. This evaluation considers whether alcohol intoxication management services make a difference to health services. We interviewed and observed people who work in night-time environments, surveyed patients in alcohol intoxication management services and accident and emergency departments and analysed accident and emergency department and ambulance data. Alcohol intoxication management services were acceptable to patients and staff but did not benefit from agreed national standards and vary considerably in the services they provide. We were unable to provide consistent evidence that alcohol intoxication management services divert patients away from accident and emergency departments. However, alcohol intoxication management services led by nurse practitioners, though more expensive to run, are likely to be the most effective, and, although the costs of alcohol intoxication management services are greater than the savings made from avoided costs of emergency department attendances, alcohol intoxication management services led by nurse practitioners have the lowest cost per attendance avoided of the alcohol intoxication management services examined. Ambulance response times improved in cities with alcohol intoxication management services, and there are probably other, unmeasurable, benefits of alcohol intoxication management services that could improve the validity of future evaluations.

# Health Services and Delivery Research

ISSN 2050-4349 (Print)

ISSN 2050-4357 (Online)

This journal is a member of and subscribes to the principles of the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) ([www.publicationethics.org/](http://www.publicationethics.org/)).

Editorial contact: [journals.library@nihr.ac.uk](mailto:journals.library@nihr.ac.uk)

The full HS&DR archive is freely available to view online at [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/hsdr](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/hsdr). Print-on-demand copies can be purchased from the report pages of the NIHR Journals Library website: [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk)

## Criteria for inclusion in the *Health Services and Delivery Research* journal

Reports are published in *Health Services and Delivery Research* (HS&DR) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HS&DR programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

## HS&DR programme

The HS&DR programme funds research to produce evidence to impact on the quality, accessibility and organisation of health and social care services. This includes evaluations of how the NHS and social care might improve delivery of services.

For more information about the HS&DR programme please visit the website at <https://www.nihr.ac.uk/explore-nihr/funding-programmes/health-services-and-delivery-research.htm>

## This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by the HS&DR programme or one of its preceding programmes as project number 14/04/25. The contractual start date was in January 2016. The final report began editorial review in March 2019 and was accepted for publication in September 2019. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HS&DR editors and production house have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the final report document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HS&DR programme or the Department of Health and Social Care. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HS&DR programme or the Department of Health and Social Care.

© Queen's Printer and Controller of HMSO 2020. This work was produced by Moore *et al.* under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health and Social Care. This issue may be freely reproduced for the purposes of private research and study and extracts (or indeed, the full report) may be included in professional journals provided that suitable acknowledgement is made and the reproduction is not associated with any form of advertising. Applications for commercial reproduction should be addressed to: NIHR Journals Library, National Institute for Health Research, Evaluation, Trials and Studies Coordinating Centre, Alpha House, University of Southampton Science Park, Southampton SO16 7NS, UK.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library ([www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk)), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland ([www.prepress-projects.co.uk](http://www.prepress-projects.co.uk)).

## Editor-in-Chief of *Health Services and Delivery Research* and NIHR Journals Library

---

**Professor Ken Stein** Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

### NIHR Journals Library Editors

---

**Professor John Powell** Chair of HTA and EME Editorial Board and Editor-in-Chief of HTA and EME journals. Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK, and Senior Clinical Researcher, Nuffield Department of Primary Care Health Sciences, University of Oxford, UK

**Professor Andrée Le May** Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals) and Editor-in-Chief of HS&DR, PGfAR, PHR journals

**Professor Matthias Beck** Professor of Management, Cork University Business School, Department of Management and Marketing, University College Cork, Ireland

**Dr Tessa Crilly** Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

**Dr Eugenia Cronin** Senior Scientific Advisor, Wessex Institute, UK

**Dr Peter Davidson** Consultant Advisor, Wessex Institute, University of Southampton, UK

**Ms Tara Lamont** Director, NIHR Dissemination Centre, UK

**Dr Catriona McDaid** Senior Research Fellow, York Trials Unit, Department of Health Sciences, University of York, UK

**Professor William McGuire** Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

**Professor Geoffrey Meads** Professor of Wellbeing Research, University of Winchester, UK

**Professor John Norrie** Chair in Medical Statistics, University of Edinburgh, UK

**Professor James Raftery** Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

**Dr Rob Riemsma** Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

**Professor Helen Roberts** Professor of Child Health Research, UCL Great Ormond Street Institute of Child Health, UK

**Professor Jonathan Ross** Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

**Professor Helen Snooks** Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

**Professor Ken Stein** Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

**Professor Jim Thornton** Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

**Professor Martin Underwood** Warwick Clinical Trials Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, UK

Please visit the website for a list of editors: [www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors](http://www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors)

**Editorial contact:** [journals.library@nihr.ac.uk](mailto:journals.library@nihr.ac.uk)