Moulded cast compared with K-wire fixation after manipulation of an acute dorsally displaced distal radius fracture: the DRAFFT 2 RCT

Matthew L Costa,^{1*} Juul Achten,¹ Alexander Ooms,² May Ee Png,³ Jonathan Cook,² Melina Dritsaki,² Sarah E Lamb,^{1,4} Robin Lerner,^{1,5} Kylea Draper,¹ Marta Campolier,¹ Helen Dakin,⁶ Alwin McGibbon,⁷ Nicholas Parsons,⁸ Helen Hedley,⁹ Joseph Dias¹⁰ and the DRAFFT 2 Collaborators[†]

¹Oxford Trauma and Emergency Care, Kadoorie Research Centre, Nuffield Department of Orthopaedic, Rheumatology and Musculoskeletal Sciences, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

²Centre for Statistics in Medicine, Oxford Clinical Trials Research Unit, Nuffield Department of Orthopaedics, Rheumatology and Musculoskeletal Sciences, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

- ³Nuffield Department of Primary Care Health Sciences, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK
- ⁴College of Medicine and Health, St Luke's Campus, University of Exeter, Exeter, UK ⁵Blizard Institute, Queen Mary University of London, London, UK
- ⁶Nuffield Department of Population Health, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK
- ⁷Patient and public involvement group member, Wimbourne, UK
- ⁸Statistics and Epidemiology Unit, Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, Coventry, UK
- ⁹Department of Orthopaedics, University Hospitals Coventry and Warwickshire NHS Trust, Coventry, UK
- ¹⁰AToMS Academic Team of Musculoskeletal Surgery, University Hospitals of Leicester NHS Trust, Leicester, UK

*Corresponding author matthew.costa@ndorms.ox.ac.uk

†The DRAFFT 2 Collaborators are listed in Appendix 1.

Declared competing interests of authors: Matthew L Costa is a National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Senior Investigator and a member of the General Board for the NIHR Health Technology Assessment (HTA) funding stream. Sarah E Lamb was on the HTA Additional Capacity Funding Board (2012–15), the HTA End of Life Care and Add-on Studies Board (September 2015), the HTA Prioritisation Group Board (2010–15), the HTA Trauma Board (2007–8) and the HTA Maternal, Neonatal and Child Health Methods Group (2013–15). She was also the deputy chairperson of the HTA Primary Care Themed Call Board (2013–14) and chairperson of the NIHR Clinical Trials Unit Standing Advisory Committee (2012–16). Jonathan Cook was a member of the HTA Efficient Study Designs Board 2014 (2015–16) and the HTA End of Life Care and Add-on Studies (2015–16). Joseph Dias reports grants from the NIHR HTA programme (project numbers 11/36/37 and 15/102/04) outside the submitted work.

Published February 2022 DOI: 10.3310/RLCF6332

Plain English summary

The DRAFFT 2 RCT Health Technology Assessment 2022; Vol. 26: No. 11 DOI: 10.3310/RLCF6332

NIHR Journals Library www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

Plain English summary

M any patients with a wrist fracture can be treated with a simple cast or splint. However, if the broken bones have moved out of position, patients are frequently offered a manipulation of the fracture to restore the position of the broken bones. The bones may then be held in place with metal implants while they heal. A moulded plaster cast, shaped to support the bones, is an alternative treatment that avoids metal implants, but there is little research to suggest which treatment is better.

The Distal Radius Acute Fracture Fixation Trial 2 (DRAFFT 2) study compared surgical fixation with metal wires with a moulded cast for patients with a broken wrist. Half of the patients underwent surgical fixation and half were given the moulded cast. The decision about which treatment patients were given was made by chance using a computer to ensure a fair comparison. The patients in both groups described their own wrist function and quality of life in the first year after their treatment and these descriptions were compared.

A total of 500 patients took part at 36 NHS hospitals in the UK. The patients treated with a moulded cast reported very similar wrist function and quality of life to that of the patients treated with surgical fixation. However, one in eight patients treated with the moulded cast later required surgery because their broken bones had fallen back out of position.

This study showed that a moulded cast is as good as, but costs less than, surgical fixation for patients with a broken wrist in terms of wrist function. However, a small proportion of the patients treated with a moulded cast may require later surgery if the broken bones cannot be held in position by the cast alone.

Health Technology Assessment

ISSN 1366-5278 (Print)

ISSN 2046-4924 (Online)

Impact factor: 4.014

Health Technology Assessment is indexed in MEDLINE, CINAHL, EMBASE, the Cochrane Library and Clarivate Analytics Science Citation Index.

This journal is a member of and subscribes to the principles of the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) (www.publicationethics.org/).

Editorial contact: journals.library@nihr.ac.uk

The full HTA archive is freely available to view online at www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/hta. Print-on-demand copies can be purchased from the report pages of the NIHR Journals Library website: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

Criteria for inclusion in the Health Technology Assessment journal

Reports are published in *Health Technology Assessment* (HTA) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HTA programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

Reviews in *Health Technology Assessment* are termed 'systematic' when the account of the search appraisal and synthesis methods (to minimise biases and random errors) would, in theory, permit the replication of the review by others.

HTA programme

Health Technology Assessment (HTA) research is undertaken where some evidence already exists to show that a technology can be effective and this needs to be compared to the current standard intervention to see which works best. Research can evaluate any intervention used in the treatment, prevention or diagnosis of disease, provided the study outcomes lead to findings that have the potential to be of direct benefit to NHS patients. Technologies in this context mean any method used to promote health; prevent and treat disease; and improve rehabilitation or long-term care. They are not confined to new drugs and include any intervention used in the treatment, prevention or diagnosis of disease.

The journal is indexed in NHS Evidence via its abstracts included in MEDLINE and its Technology Assessment Reports inform National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) guidance. HTA research is also an important source of evidence for National Screening Committee (NSC) policy decisions.

This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by the HTA programme as project number 15/27/01. The contractual start date was in July 2016. The draft report began editorial review in September 2020 and was accepted for publication in April 2021. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HTA editors and publisher have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the draft document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health and Social Care. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, NETSCC, the HTA programme or the Department of Health and Social Care.

Copyright © 2022 Costa *et al.* This work was produced by Costa *et al.* under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health and Social Care. This is an Open Access publication distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution CC BY 4.0 licence, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, reproduction and adaption in any medium and for any purpose provided that it is properly attributed. See: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/. For attribution the title, original author(s), the publication source – NIHR Journals Library, and the DOI of the publication must be cited.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).

NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

Professor Ken Stein Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editors

Professor John Powell Chair of HTA and EME Editorial Board and Editor-in-Chief of HTA and EME journals. Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK, and Professor of Digital Health Care, Nuffield Department of Primary Care Health Sciences, University of Oxford, UK

Professor Andrée Le May Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (HSDR, PGfAR, PHR journals) and Editor-in-Chief of HSDR, PGfAR, PHR journals

Professor Matthias Beck Professor of Management, Cork University Business School, Department of Management and Marketing, University College Cork, Ireland

Dr Tessa Crilly Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Eugenia Cronin Consultant in Public Health, Delta Public Health Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Peter Davidson Consultant Advisor, Wessex Institute, University of Southampton, UK

Ms Tara Lamont Senior Adviser, Wessex Institute, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Catriona McDaid Reader in Trials, Department of Health Sciences, University of York, UK

Professor William McGuire Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

Professor Geoffrey Meads Emeritus Professor of Wellbeing Research, University of Winchester, UK

Professor James Raftery Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Rob Riemsma Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

Professor Helen Roberts Professor of Child Health Research, Child and Adolescent Mental Health, Palliative Care and Paediatrics Unit, Population Policy and Practice Programme, UCL Great Ormond Street Institute of Child Health, London, UK

Professor Jonathan Ross Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

Professor Helen Snooks Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Professor Ken Stein Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

Professor Jim Thornton Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

Please visit the website for a list of editors: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

Editorial contact: journals.library@nihr.ac.uk