Components of interventions to reduce restrictive practices with children and young people in institutional settings: the Contrast systematic mapping review

John Baker,^{1*} Kathryn Berzins,¹ Krysia Canvin,¹ Sarah Kendal,¹ Stella Branthonne-Foster,² Judy Wright,³ Tim McDougall,⁴ Barry Goldson,⁵ Ian Kellar⁶ and Joy Duxbury⁷

Declared competing interests of authors: none

Published May 2022 DOI: 10.3310/YVKT5692

Plain English summary

Contrast systematic mapping review

Health and Social Care Delivery Research 2022; Vol. 10: No. 8

DOI: 10.3310/YVKT5692

NIHR Journals Library www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

¹School of Healthcare, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK

²Patient and public involvement representative, London, UK

³Leeds Institute of Health Sciences, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK

⁴Specialist Services, Lancashire and South Cumbria NHS Foundation Trust, Preston, UK

⁵Department of Sociology, Social Policy and Criminology, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, UK

⁶School of Psychology, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK

⁷Faculty of Health, Psychology and Social Care, Manchester Metropolitan University, Manchester, UK

^{*}Corresponding author J.Baker@leeds.ac.uk

Plain English summary

can be harmful for service users and staff. Many interventions exist for reducing the use of restrictive practices, but we do not know which ones work or why. Staff training could reduce the use of restrictive practices by encouraging staff to behave differently, for example by learning better ways of talking to somebody who has become upset or aggressive.

We knew about a list of 93 techniques for changing behaviour. This list is used like a dictionary to look up terms that best describe parts of an intervention to make it easier to describe and compare them. We wanted to see how many different interventions we could find and to describe these interventions using this list.

We identified all the interventions that we could find across institutional settings for children and young people, and recorded information such as participants, location and how success was measured. We looked in detail at the interventions and described the techniques using the list. We also assessed the quality of research about the interventions.

We found 82 different interventions, mostly in mental health settings. Techniques involving staff training; changing the environment to prevent incidents; setting goals for staff to work towards, such as reducing how often they use a restrictive practice; and giving staff feedback about incidents were commonly found as part of the most successful interventions and may be worth investigating further.

This study is, to our knowledge, the first to describe these interventions in a standard way. It may help researchers, policy-makers and clinicians describe and understand interventions to reduce restrictive practices in children and young people's institutional settings.

Health and Social Care Delivery Research

ISSN 2755-0060 (Print)

ISSN 2755-0079 (Online)

This journal is a member of and subscribes to the principles of the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE) (www.publicationethics.org/).

Editorial contact: journals.library@nihr.ac.uk

This journal was previously published as *Health Services and Delivery Research* (Volumes 1–9); ISSN 2050-4349 (print), ISSN 2050-4357 (online)

The full HSDR archive is freely available to view online at www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/hsdr. Print-on-demand copies can be purchased from the report pages of the NIHR Journals Library website: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk

Criteria for inclusion in the Health and Social Care Delivery Research journal

Reports are published in *Health and Social Care Delivery Research* (HSDR) if (1) they have resulted from work for the HSDR programme, and (2) they are of a sufficiently high scientific quality as assessed by the reviewers and editors.

HSDR programme

The HSDR programme funds research to produce evidence to impact on the quality, accessibility and organisation of health and social care services. This includes evaluations of how the NHS and social care might improve delivery of services.

For more information about the HSDR programme please visit the website at https://www.nihr.ac.uk/explore-nihr/funding-programmes/health-and-social-care-delivery-research.htm

This report

The research reported in this issue of the journal was funded by the HSDR programme or one of its preceding programmes as project number NIHR127281. The contractual start date was in July 2019. The final report began editorial review in October 2020 and was accepted for publication in June 2021. The authors have been wholly responsible for all data collection, analysis and interpretation, and for writing up their work. The HSDR editors and production house have tried to ensure the accuracy of the authors' report and would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive comments on the final report document. However, they do not accept liability for damages or losses arising from material published in this report.

This report presents independent research funded by the National Institute for Health and Care Research (NIHR). The views and opinions expressed by authors in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the NHS, the NIHR, the HSDR programme or the Department of Health and Social Care. If there are verbatim quotations included in this publication the views and opinions expressed by the interviewees are those of the interviewees and do not necessarily reflect those of the authors, those of the NHS, the NIHR, the HSDR programme or the Department of Health and Social Care.

Copyright © 2022 Baker *et al.* This work was produced by Baker *et al.* under the terms of a commissioning contract issued by the Secretary of State for Health and Social Care. This is an Open Access publication distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution CC BY 4.0 licence, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, reproduction and adaption in any medium and for any purpose provided that it is properly attributed. See: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/. For attribution the title, original author(s), the publication source – NIHR Journals Library, and the DOI of the publication must be cited.

Published by the NIHR Journals Library (www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk), produced by Prepress Projects Ltd, Perth, Scotland (www.prepress-projects.co.uk).

NIHR Journals Library Editor-in-Chief

Professor Ken Stein Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

NIHR Journals Library Editors

Professor John Powell Chair of HTA and EME Editorial Board and Editor-in-Chief of HTA and EME journals. Consultant Clinical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE), UK, and Professor of Digital Health Care, Nuffield Department of Primary Care Health Sciences, University of Oxford, UK

Professor Andrée Le May Chair of NIHR Journals Library Editorial Group (HSDR, PGfAR, PHR journals) and Editor-in-Chief of HSDR, PGfAR, PHR journals

Professor Matthias Beck Professor of Management, Cork University Business School, Department of Management and Marketing, University College Cork, Ireland

Dr Tessa Crilly Director, Crystal Blue Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Eugenia Cronin Consultant in Public Health, Delta Public Health Consulting Ltd, UK

Dr Peter Davidson Consultant Advisor, Wessex Institute, University of Southampton, UK

Ms Tara Lamont Senior Adviser, Wessex Institute, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Catriona McDaid Reader in Trials, Department of Health Sciences, University of York, UK

Professor William McGuire Professor of Child Health, Hull York Medical School, University of York, UK

Professor Geoffrey Meads Emeritus Professor of Wellbeing Research, University of Winchester, UK

Professor James Raftery Professor of Health Technology Assessment, Wessex Institute, Faculty of Medicine, University of Southampton, UK

Dr Rob Riemsma Reviews Manager, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd, UK

Professor Helen Roberts Professor of Child Health Research, Child and Adolescent Mental Health, Palliative Care and Paediatrics Unit, Population Policy and Practice Programme, UCL Great Ormond Street Institute of Child Health, London, UK

Professor Jonathan Ross Professor of Sexual Health and HIV, University Hospital Birmingham, UK

Professor Helen Snooks Professor of Health Services Research, Institute of Life Science, College of Medicine, Swansea University, UK

Professor Ken Stein Professor of Public Health, University of Exeter Medical School, UK

Professor Jim Thornton Professor of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, UK

Please visit the website for a list of editors: www.journalslibrary.nihr.ac.uk/about/editors

Editorial contact: journals.library@nihr.ac.uk